



COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

* * * * *

IN RE: PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR PROPOSED RULE MAKING: C02

* * * * *

BEFORE: JESSICA SHIRLEY, Chair
LAURA GRIFFIN, Member
DAREK JAGIELA, Member
ALLEN LANDIS, Member
HALEY BOOK, Member
JENNIFER SWAN, Member

HEARING: Thursday, December 10, 2020
1:00 p.m.

LOCATION: VIDEO CONFERENCE

WITNESSES:

Reporter: Bernadette M. Black

Any reproduction of this transcript
is prohibited without authorization
by the certifying agency

I N D E X

1		
2		
3	OPENING REMARKS	
4	By Chair	9 - 14
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Mr. Aaron	14 - 17
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Haley	17 - 19
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Mr. Ketyer	19 - 22
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Ms. Enderby	22 - 26
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Ms. Cramer	26 - 29
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Peeling	29 - 31
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Ms. Harvey	31 - 33
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Mr. Harvey	33 - 35
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Mr. Cullen	35 - 39
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Mr. Brown	39 - 42
25		

I N D E X (cont.)

1		
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Ms. Coptis	42 - 46
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Ms. Sinsky	47 - 48
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Lodges	48 - 52
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Rep. Otten	52 - 55
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Ms. Barry	55 - 56
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Mr. Kaplan	56 - 62
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Shoemaker	62 - 66
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Mr. Bloom	66 - 70
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Mr. Croskey	70 - 74
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Mr. Marcheski	74 - 76
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Ms. Marks	76 - 81
25		

I N D E X (cont.)

1		
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Ms. Parks	81 - 84
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Mr. Groce	84 - 88
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Block	88 - 91
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Ms. Brandon	92 - 96
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Mr. Hammerstrom	96 - 99
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Ms. White	99 - 103
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Mr. Glanyer	103 - 107
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Mr. Sorek	107 - 110
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Ms. Finley	110 - 113
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Mr. Hescox	113 - 117
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Mr. Cobert	117 - 121
25		

I N D E X (cont.)

1		
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Mr. Goodson	121 - 125
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Ms. Gulden	125 - 127
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Mr. Winkler	127 - 131
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Ms. Martin	131 - 135
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Ms. Resnick-Day	135 - 139
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Mr. Makowka	139 - 141
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Ms. Rubenstein	141 - 144
17	TESTIMONY	
18	By Ms. Wanko	144 - 147
19	TESTIMONY	
20	By Ms. Ames	147 - 150
21	TESTIMONY	
22	By Ms. Eckridge	150 - 152
23	TESTIMONY	
24	By Ms. Blade	152 - 155
25		

I N D E X (cont.)

1		
2		
3	TESTIMONY	
4	By Mr. Beres	155 - 157
5	TESTIMONY	
6	By Ms. McStay	157 - 161
7	TESTIMONY	
8	By Ms. Skiff	161 - 165
9	TESTIMONY	
10	By Mr. Kushner	165 - 169
11	TESTIMONY	
12	By Rep. Struzzi	169 - 174
13	TESTIMONY	
14	By Mr. Kline	171 - 178
15	TESTIMONY	
16	By Mr. Rightstone	178 - 181
17	CLOSING STATEMENTS	
18	By Chair	181 - 182
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

E X H I B I T S

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

		Page	Page
<u>Number</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Offered</u>	<u>Admitted</u>

NONE OFFERED

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIR: This is the Environmental Quality Board's or EQB's, public hearing on the proposed rulemaking for the Pennsylvania CO2 budget trading program. My name is Jessica Shirley and I am the policy director for the Department of Environmental Protection. I am facilitating this hearing on behalf of the Environmental Quality Board. Assisting me today is Darek Jagiela, our host. Haley Book, the senior advisor of climate and energy for DEP. And Jennifer Swan, who most of you corresponded with to register for this hearing.

I officially call this hearing to order at one o'clock p.m. This public hearing will be recorded in its entirety. Additionally, a stenographer will be transcribing the hearing. The purpose of this hearing is to formally accept testimony on the proposed rulemaking. The proposed rulemaking was adopted by the EQB at its meeting on September 15th, 2020. It proposes to establish a program to limit carbon dioxide or CO2 emissions from fossil fuel fired power plants located in Pennsylvania, with an electricity generation capacity equal to or greater than 25 megawatts.

1 The purpose of this proposed
2 rulemaking is to reduce carbon dioxide emissions,
3 which is a greenhouse gas and major contributor to
4 climate change impacts, in a manner that protects
5 public health, welfare and the environment. Under
6 the authority of Pennsylvania's Air Pollution
7 Control Act, the proposed rulemaking would establish
8 Pennsylvania's participation in the regional
9 greenhouse gas initiative, or RGGI, a regional CO2
10 budget trading program.

11 In addition to reducing emissions,
12 Pennsylvania will also see a decrease in harmful
13 NOX, SO2 and particulate matter emissions, as well
14 as ground level ozone pollution. Human exposure to
15 these air pollutants contributes to respiratory and
16 cardiovascular health problems including asthma,
17 bronchitis, heart attacks and strokes. By
18 participating in RGGI, DEP estimates that
19 Pennsylvania will see CO2 emission reductions of
20 around 188,000,000 tons by 2030.

21 This concludes the summary of the
22 rulemaking. If you would like to access a more
23 detailed explanation of regulatory amendments
24 included in this rulemaking, you can visit ECOMMENT
25 on DEP's webpage and select regulations.

1 In order to give everyone an equal
2 opportunity to comment on this proposal, I would
3 like to establish the following ground rules. Haley
4 is going to provide some of this information in the
5 chat box, so you don't need to write everything
6 down. I will call upon the first witnesses who have
7 signed up to testify at this hearing. All who
8 signed up were given a number indicating the order
9 in which witnesses will be called to speak. Only
10 those who signed up by contacting Jennifer Swan as
11 indicated on the EQB webpage will be called upon to
12 provide testimony.

13 Testimony is limited to five minutes
14 with each witness. And I will have a timer on the
15 screen. Please note that written and spoken
16 testimony carry the same weight. If you should run
17 out of the time for your spoken testimony, we will
18 read the rest of your comments from your written
19 testimony. As advised in registration
20 correspondence, please provide a copy of your
21 written testimony through reg comments at PA.gov.

22 Your email must note that you are
23 submitting testimony for proposed rulemaking, CO2
24 budget trading program, along with the following
25 information, your first and last name, your mailing

1 address, email address and if you are commenting on
2 behalf of an organization.

3 Testimony is not required to be five
4 minutes long. If others who provide testimony
5 before you are making similar statements to yours,
6 you are free to shorten or summarize your verbal
7 testimony at this time and still provide your full
8 testimony by email. This will allow us to hear from
9 more commenters at this hearing. Through the sign
10 up process, prospective commenters were requested to
11 designate on witness to designate testimony on
12 behalf of an organization.

13 Please state your name, address, the
14 city and state are sufficient, and affiliation, if
15 you have one, for the record, prior to presenting
16 your testimony. The EQB would appreciate your help
17 by spelling out your name and terms that may not be
18 generally familiar, so that the transcript can be as
19 accurate as possible. Because the purpose of a
20 hearing is to receive comments on the proposal, EQB
21 members or DEP staff cannot address questions about
22 the proposed rulemaking during the duration of the
23 hearing.

24 In addition to or in place of verbal
25 testimony presented at today's hearing, interested

1 persons may also submit written comments on this
2 proposal. Again, written and verbal comments hold
3 the same weight when considered in the finalization
4 of this proposed rulemaking. All testimony and
5 written comments provided become in part with our
6 record. All comments must be received by the EQB on
7 or before January 14th, 2021.

8 There are a few different ways to
9 submit written comments. Comments may be submitted
10 online through ECOMMENT, accessible through DEP's
11 website, by clicking the ECOMMENT icon near the top
12 of DEP's homepage, www.DEP.PA.gov. While comments
13 may be submitted by email at [reg_comments at PA.gov](mailto:reg_comments@PA.gov).
14 All comments are entered into ECOMMENT and are
15 accessible to the public.

16 A subject name of the proposed
17 rulemaking and a return name and address must be
18 included in each email. Comments may also be sent
19 through the U.S. Postal Mail, addressed to the
20 Environmental Quality Board, PO box 8477,
21 Harrisburg, PA, 17105-8477. All testimony received
22 at this hearing, as well as written comments
23 received by January 14th, 2021, will be considered
24 by the EQB, and will be included in a comment and
25 response document, which will be prepared by DEP and

1 reviewed by the EQB, prior to the board taking its
2 final action on this regulation.

3 And now I will share my screen and
4 call the first commenter. Okay. First up, we have
5 number one, Steve Aaron. Do we have Steve on the
6 line?

7 MR. AARON: I'm here. Can you hear me
8 okay?

9 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you great.
10 Go ahead, Steve. I'll start your timer.

11 MR. AARON: Thank you so much.

12 Good afternoon, everyone. My name is
13 Steve Aaron, that's A-A-R-O-N. I am a small
14 business owner in Harrisburg, Dauphin County. And I
15 am also one of the organizers of a coalition called
16 Nuclear Powers Pennsylvania. We work to educate our
17 fellow Pennsylvanians about the economic and
18 environmental benefits of nuclear energy and the
19 industry's positive impact on local communities
20 throughout the Keystone State.

21 There has been some discussion in
22 recent months about the negative economic impact on
23 the fossil fuel sector should Pennsylvania put into
24 place a market based effort to reduce carbon
25 pollution from electric power plants. I don't think

1 enough has been said about the potential economic
2 and employment impact facing our nuclear industry.
3 The operations of Pennsylvania's four nuclear plants
4 account for 15,000 full-time direct and indirect
5 jobs. We have an ecosystem of more than 500
6 companies working in nuclear energy, including names
7 like Westing House and GE Hitachi.

8 Our nuclear fleet contributes about
9 two billion dollars to the state GDP and is
10 responsible for \$65,000,000 in net state tax
11 revenues. Don't forget, each of the state's eight
12 nuclear reactors must be refueled every 18 to 24
13 months. When they go offline, more than 1,000
14 laborers, most from right here in Pennsylvania,
15 enter the plants for additional employment
16 opportunities. These are good paying jobs and the
17 local businesses in those communities count on that
18 infusion of income every other year.

19 Here where I live in central
20 Pennsylvania, we've had to come to grips with losing
21 Three Mile Island because policy makers chose not to
22 recognize the tremendous value nuclear power
23 delivers to our state. As a consequence, we've lost
24 hundreds of family sustaining jobs. The United Way
25 has lost a key contributor. Our civic institutions

1 have lost volunteer board members and those laborers
2 now have one less plant for employment
3 opportunities.

4 This isn't theoretical. These are
5 jobs that will never be replaced. Of course, we
6 lost more than just an economic engine for our
7 region. We also lost our largest source of
8 emissions free energy. TMI alone produced more zero
9 emission energy than all of the state's renewable
10 energy combined. Until Pennsylvania starts to level
11 the playing field for carbon free electricity
12 producers, we are concerned that other Pennsylvania
13 communities will suffer the same fate as Middletown
14 and follow Three Mile Island.

15 While we are pleased to see the owners
16 of the Beaver Valley Nuclear Plant chose to keep
17 that plant open, they've made it clear that they
18 would need to revisit deactivation if the state
19 doesn't remain on course with its carbon reduction
20 plans. Were that to happen, we'd be facing
21 thousands more lost jobs and a further depletion of
22 our ability to deliver carbon free electricity.

23 At a time when all Pennsylvanians are
24 feeling the stress and anxiety of record high
25 unemployment as we try to manage this pandemic, I

1 think we all can agree that every job, every
2 paycheck is precious. I hope you'll consider the
3 men and women who work in Pennsylvania's nuclear
4 industry as you make your recommendations for
5 Pennsylvania's energy future. Thank you so much.

6 CHAIR: Thank you, Steve.

7 And next up, we have number two,
8 Marsha Haley. Do we have Marsha on the line?

9 MS. HALEY: Hi. Can you hear me?

10 CHAIR: We can hear you great. I'm
11 going to start your timer.

12 MS. HALEY: Okay.

13 Thanks for allowing me to speak today.

14 My name is Marsha Haley, H-A-L-E-Y. I live in
15 Seven Fields, Pennsylvania, which is north of
16 Pittsburgh. And I am testifying as an individual
17 resident of Pennsylvania as a physician and a
18 parent. It is no secret that our air quality in the
19 Pittsburgh area is poor.

20 As a doctor working in Allegheny
21 County, I see the effects of air pollution in my
22 practice. Our children, whose bodies take in more
23 air than adults, are the most susceptible. The 2019
24 American Lung Association state of the air report
25 found that the air quality in the Pittsburgh area

1 worsened for the second year in a row. And has the
2 only failing grade outside of California.

3 Philadelphia has similarly unhealthy
4 air. If R-G-G-I is enacted in Pennsylvania, there
5 will not only be a decrease in CO2 emissions, but in
6 other harmful pollutants like nitrogen oxide, sulfur
7 dioxide and particulate matter emission. These are
8 the substances that lead to the more immediate
9 health effects of bad air, such as asthma. Long term
10 exposure to these substances increases the risk of
11 heart attacks, premature death and lung cancer.

12 Air pollution can also enter other
13 parts of the environment such as rivers and soil.
14 Enacting RGGI will also be cost effective from a
15 public health standpoint. Pennsylvania has the
16 highest rate of premature deaths from air pollution
17 in the U.S. This results in lost productivity and
18 higher healthcare costs. Air quality improvements
19 in the states with RGGI programs has led to public
20 health benefits with an estimated value of \$5.7
21 billion dollars.

22 A 2008 study estimated that during the
23 first three compliance periods the RGGI program
24 yielded a net benefit of \$4.7 billion dollars to the
25 RGGI states and brought more than 40,000 job years

1 to the region. In summary, I support RGGI in
2 Pennsylvania from a medical, public health and
3 economic standpoint. Thank you.

4 CHAIR: Thank you, Marsha.

5 Next up we have Edward Ketyer. Do we
6 have Edward on the line?

7 MR. KETYER: Hello? Can you hear me?

8 CHAIR: Hi, yes. We can hear you.

9 MR. KETYER: Very good. Thank you
10 very much. My name is Dr. Ned Ketyer, K-E-T-Y-E-R.

11 I am a pediatrician living in southwestern
12 Pennsylvania. I am a husband and a father of three
13 adult children. And I am speaking as a private
14 citizen today. But I must disclose to you that I am
15 a member of the American Academy of Pediatric
16 Counsel on Environmental Health. And a consultant
17 for Southwest Pennsylvania Environmental Health
18 Project, a board member of Physicians for Social
19 Responsibility of Pennsylvania and a Climate Reality
20 Project leader.

21 Over the last several days you've
22 heard testimony overwhelmingly in favor of the
23 regional greenhouse gas initiative. I want to point
24 out that those who denied the benefits of joining
25 RGGI also deny the climate emergency we are in. You

1 will not hear the words climate change or health in
2 their statements, not one word. But that's really
3 what we're talking about today.

4 There are things that we already know
5 about climate change and about health objective
6 evidence-based facts that we don't need to debate
7 any longer. The fact is, time has run out to do the
8 right thing and do something we should have been
9 doing for years, for decades, even. Reducing
10 greenhouse gas emissions from the energy sector in
11 order to slow and then stop the climate crisis.

12 The problem is, we don't have anymore
13 time to spin our wheels, debate and deflect and then
14 have our elected representatives do nothing. That
15 is not a political statement. It is based on the
16 ten words that describe the overwhelming scientific
17 consensus about climate change. Experts agree, it's
18 real, it's us, it's bad, there's hope. But there's
19 only hope if we decide that RGGI is needed. And
20 there is only hope if we all recognize that RGGI
21 alone won't solve the climate crisis.

22 We need to use every tool in our
23 toolbox to solve it. And RGGI is a really important
24 tool. So let's just begin by acknowledging what we
25 all learned in grade school science and math.

1 Extracting and burning fossil fuels produces
2 emissions of greenhouse gasses. Those greenhouse
3 gasses accumulate in the atmosphere trapping heat
4 and warming the air, the land and the oceans and
5 causing the climate to change well beyond prior
6 human experience. And then it's important to
7 recognize how the change in climate directly impacts
8 our health in long and intense heat waves, for more
9 powerful extreme weather events and excessive
10 precipitation and flooding here and droughts and
11 water scarcity elsewhere.

12 From the growing threats of vector
13 borne diseases, such as Lyme's Disease, which is a
14 growing public health problem here in Pennsylvania.
15 Air quality is worse in a warming world, and
16 especially in Pennsylvania where air quality pretty
17 much stinks as a baseline. The list goes on.

18 You can't have a discussion about RGGI
19 without using the words climate change and health.
20 The primary principle in solving human caused
21 climate change and improving health is simple, stop
22 expelling more greenhouse gas pollution into the
23 atmosphere. So I'll let others in this hearing tell
24 you all about how RGGI is successful in the states
25 that have adopted it.

1 How it significantly reduces harmful
2 pollution like bi-particulate matters, sulfur
3 dioxide, heavy metals and greenhouse gasses. How it
4 objectively improves health and saves lives. And we
5 should be clear, improving health and avoiding
6 health costs associated with pollution from power
7 plants, fewer heart attacks and strokes in adults,
8 fewer developmental problems and asthma attacks in
9 children.

10 This will bring enormous economic
11 benefits to our state and citizens. Parents and
12 pediatricians like me cannot control the air that
13 our children breathe. Agencies like the DEP and the
14 Environmental Quality Board can. You can be heroes
15 and help protect the health of my children, our
16 children, and generations to come and the planet
17 they live on by joining neighbor states and adopting
18 the regional greenhouse gas initiative. Thank you.

19 CHAIR: Thank you, Ned. Next, we have
20 number five, Hannah Enderby.

21 MS. ENDERBY: Hello. Can you guys
22 hear me?

23 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

24 MS. ENDERBY: Awesome. Go ahead and
25 start the clock. All right. Hello everyone. My

1 name is Hannah Enderby. That's spelled E-N-D-E-R-B-
2 Y. I am a resident from Bethel Park, Pennsylvania.

3 And I am testifying as a 22 year old native
4 Pennsylvanian and fourth year environmental science
5 and management major at Duquesne University. My
6 ultimate goal is to help in solving worldwide major
7 climate crises.

8 But somehow I find it ironic that the
9 state I'm from is one of the leaders in the western
10 world contributing to manmade global warming. As a
11 devoted runner and hiker who has spent hundreds of
12 hours walking and running the trails and beautiful
13 parks, slash, forests of Pennsylvania, I've noticed
14 the declining quality of our forests and air
15 quality.

16 The effects of pollution are becoming
17 more apparent as the number of cold winter days
18 decreases and the number of poor air quality days
19 increases. Also, my favorite outdoor activities
20 have become harder over the years with my asthma.
21 Before I go into - before I go outside to run or
22 walk I always check the air quality so I am not
23 putting myself at risk for asthma or chronic lung
24 damage from breathing in the air on a poor air
25 quality day.

1 These poor air quality days are more
2 frequent. And it's concerning to me how much
3 pollution Pennsylvania generates. In order to
4 meaningfully address climate change in Pennsylvania,
5 a good start is participating in the regional
6 greenhouse gas initiative, or RGGI. RGGI's cap
7 investment mechanism is part of a market based
8 program that facilitates reductions in carbon
9 emissions from the electric sector.

10 Pennsylvania's polluting power sector,
11 the fourth dirtiest in the nation, can have
12 significant emission reductions overtime. And in
13 doing so create revenues that can be used towards
14 energy efficiency and renewable energy, including
15 solar and wind that will power our future. Seeing
16 as how Pennsylvania's electric power sector emits
17 over 89,000,000 tons of carbon pollution annually,
18 action is critical in linking to a program like RGGI
19 can help put our state on track to reach net zero
20 emissions by mid-century.

21 RGGI states have reduced their overall
22 carbon emissions by 36 percent over the past decade.
23 Companies have an incentive to lower their emissions
24 as the markets drive the need to remain competitive
25 with low and no emission power - power sources.

1 RGGI is no abstraction. Rather, RGGI states have
2 reduced their carbon emissions and returned over two
3 billion dollars in proceeds to participating states.
4 These revenues power clean energy and the all
5 important jobs that come with them.

6 Additionally, electric bills in RGGI
7 states are projected to be 35 percent lower in a
8 decade than they are today. Those are real dollars
9 in consumer's pockets. In a September 2020 poll, 72
10 percent of Pennsylvania voters supported the state's
11 participation in the regional greenhouse gas
12 initiative. Today, RGGI has been successfully
13 implemented in red, blue and purple states. That
14 matters.

15 Citizens want action on climate and
16 RGGI is a real, tangible way to achieve that
17 objective while protecting public health now and
18 ensuring a cleaner, safer environment for future
19 generations. That said, I want to see the
20 Department of Environmental Protection proceed with
21 the RGGI rulemaking and quickly at that.

22 We are all beyond blessed to live in a
23 state as beautiful as Pennsylvania. And it is
24 critical that we work together to protect it for my
25 generation and future generations. And lastly, I'd

1 like to thank the DEP for hosting an accessible,
2 convenient and seamless virtual public hearing
3 process that further helps to reduce our carbon
4 footprint, as it eliminates the need to travel to
5 hearings across the state. Thank you so much.

6 CHAIR: Thank you, Hannah.

7 Next, we have number six, Kay Cramer.

8 MS. CRAMER: Hi. Can you hear me?

9 CHAIR: We can.

10 MS. CRAMER: Great.

11 First, I want to thank the DEP for
12 hosting these remote public comment sessions. My
13 name is Kay Cramer, C-R-A-M-E-R. I live on a farm
14 in southern Snyder County. In 2014, I retired after
15 many years as a home health and hospice RN.

16 Studies, including the fourth national climate
17 assessment produced by the current federal
18 administration have clarified the link between many
19 human health issues and the burning of fossil fuels.

20 The resulting CO2 particulate matter
21 and VOCs have been shown to produce respiratory
22 disease, cancer and heart disease, as well as pre-
23 term births and low birth weights in infants. I am
24 sure others will be testifying to these effects and
25 the economic consequences resulting from the health

1 impacts. But I am testifying today because I
2 believe my experience may add context to the
3 discussion around joining RGGI.

4 Hospice nurses sometimes talk among
5 themselves about the form of death they fear most.
6 You might think it would be the pain of cancer or
7 maybe heart disease, or even ALS, Lou Gehrig's
8 disease, which traps the mind inside a body that can
9 no longer function. But for me, respiratory disease
10 is my biggest fear.

11 Respiratory disease, such as Emphysema
12 or COPD often begins with a hacking, sputum filled
13 cough that is hard to control. The body becomes
14 less and less able to glean oxygen from the air as
15 the lungs fill with fluid and the tiny air sacks are
16 destroyed. I have seen patients hunched over their
17 kitchen tables, trying to pull in enough breath to
18 get the energy to eat and sleeping in recliners to
19 alleviate their breathlessness.

20 The feeling of drowning causes terror
21 and anxiety as the disease progresses. People are
22 treated with opioids to ease the breathing and anti-
23 anxiety medications to combat the fear. They are
24 usually prescribed supplemental oxygen and go around
25 the house tethered to an oxygen canister and tubing.

1 As the disease progresses, people become less and
2 less able to summon the energy to do more than sit
3 in their chairs.

4 In late stage respiratory disease,
5 medications lose their effectiveness and people
6 receive higher and higher doses. In the end,
7 though, no amount of medication can overcome the
8 oxygen deprivation. Then the person slips into
9 unconsciousness and death. Turning to our children,
10 the respiratory disease most common is asthma, which
11 can be triggered or exacerbated by breathing in the
12 pollutants from burning fossil fuels.

13 Childhood asthma has increased
14 exponentially over the last few decades, and is a
15 horrible thing to see and hear. Wheezing and
16 terrified children describe feelings of suffocation
17 similar to that of the adults with respiratory
18 disease. This is a disease that takes over young
19 people's lives as they may need inhalers and other
20 medications four to eight times a day. Triggering
21 events frequently send them and their families
22 racing for the emergency room.

23 Asthma causes many missed school days
24 for children and frequent anxiety for their parents.
25 It's not something that anyone would wish for their

1 kids and grandkids. I have read that by 2030,
2 Pennsylvania's joining RGGI could save about 640
3 premature deaths, result in about 30,000 fewer
4 hospital visits and avoid 83,000 lost work days.
5 The economic benefits of all this could be about
6 \$6.3 billion dollars from improved health alone.

7 The numbers are significant in
8 themselves. As a nurse, though, I can say that
9 numbers in no way compare to our moral
10 responsibility to alleviate the suffering of the
11 people of our Commonwealth. RGGI represents a major
12 step towards cleaning up our air pollution and
13 improving the health of Pennsylvanians. For that
14 reason, I urge PA to join RGGI. Thank you.

15 CHAIR: Thank you.

16 Next up, we have number seven, Diane
17 Peeling. Do we have Diane on the line?

18 MS. PEELING: Can you hear me?

19 CHAIR: Yes. We can hear you. Go
20 ahead and begin your testimony.

21 MS. PEELING: Okay. Super. Thank
22 you. This is Diane Peeling, P as in Peter, E-E-L-I-
23 N-G. I am from Lycoming County and I am a board
24 member of RDA, the Responsible Drilling Alliance. I
25 value this chance to express support to DEP and the

1 Environmental Quality Board for their commitment to
2 address Pennsylvania's role in combating climate
3 change. I support joining the New England states
4 and others in the carbon budget sharing compact or
5 RGGI. Other speakers can testify to the technical
6 description in the compact.

7 My testimony simply encourages our
8 participation with these other states who share
9 boundaries and therefore air quality all working
10 together to reduce carbon emissions while supporting
11 and investing in renewable energy production. This
12 compact deserves the support of our local elected
13 representatives. In our case, Senator Eugene Yaw,
14 Representative Jeff Wheeland and Representative Fred
15 Keller, are all strangely quiet. They have ignored
16 this agreement.

17 I asked them to join our neighboring
18 states, with whom we share boundaries and air in
19 this forward looking RGGI compact. Thank you.

20 CHAIR: Thank you, Diane.

21 Next, we have number eight, John
22 Harvey. Do we have John on the line? Darek, is he
23 un-muted?

24 MR. JAGIELA: I've un-muted Harvey,
25 but I'm not hearing anything.

1 CHAIR: Okay.

2 You un-muted Marian, not - okay. Is
3 John on the line, Darek, John Harvey?

4 MR. JAGIELA: I am not seeing him, no.

5 CHAIR: Okay.

6 Well we will come back to John. Since
7 we have Marian, we will move on to you.

8 MS. HARVEY: Okay.

9 John is actually my son. So I am not
10 sure what's going on with him upstairs. But I can
11 get him to come down here and speak.

12 CHAIR: Yeah.

13 MS. HARVEY: He can speak after me if
14 you want to do it that way.

15 CHAIR: Sure can.

16 MS. HARVEY: He can come down and
17 swap. Okay.

18 CHAIR: Yeah. That'd be great.

19 MS. HARVEY: So - all right. He'll
20 just come down and speak after me. Okay.

21 So my name - good afternoon. My name
22 is Marian Harvey, H-A-R-V-E-Y. I live in
23 Philadelphia. I am the mother of two teens.
24 Frankly, the health of all of our children should be
25 enough of a reason to join RGGI. We cannot, as a

1 society, continue to degrade our environment and
2 expect that their health will not degrade right
3 along with it.

4 Pennsylvania, you know, we have a
5 beautiful state with a diverse population that is
6 representative of the United States. We need to
7 take more steps to preserve its beauty and protect
8 our citizens. This is not a political issue. It is
9 a social justice, environmental and economic issue.

10 We are fortunate to be able to see the benefits of
11 RGGI in our neighboring states.

12 It has added jobs, cut emissions,
13 funded programs benefitting both low income
14 households and industry in Maryland. RGGI funds,
15 job training for low income people in the energy
16 efficiency fields. And it remains to some of the
17 industries that it's - to realize savings from the
18 program, it'll help hospitals, paper mills, builders
19 and networking infrastructure. These are all job
20 creators.

21 Pennsylvania has the opportunity to
22 join this region in emissions reductions and
23 economic growth. They do not have to be at odds.
24 We must not let this opportunity pass and further
25 delay action in our climate crisis. Our children's

1 futures depend on it. Thank you. So John asked me
2 to let you guys know that he's under Jack Harvey.
3 And if you see John Harvey, you might be able to -
4 his computer is listed as Jack Harvey.

5 MR. HARVEY: Hi. Can you hear me now?

6 CHAIR: There we go. All right.

7 MR. HARVEY: You can hear me?

8 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

9 MR. HARVEY: Okay. Hello.

10 I am Jack Harvey. I am unaffiliated.

11 I am just testifying as a citizen. I am a 17 year
12 old senior in high school in Philadelphia,
13 Pennsylvania. And I came on here to speak on this
14 because to me this is, like, this is - RGGI is a
15 necessity to my future. From what I've seen, pretty
16 much every generation before me has been told that
17 they have a whole life ahead of them. But, like, I
18 am not sure of that. I don't know what kind of
19 effects will happen within the near future.

20 Climate change affects, like, we can
21 see the affects every year. And it doesn't just
22 affect the climate. It affects weather patterns,
23 world health is going down. As the climate goes up
24 and gets drier, crops are going to decline, world
25 hunger is going to get worse, diseases are going to

1 spread, it's going to affect our already poor mental
2 health. And our breathing air is, like, going to
3 get worse and worse. It happens in Pittsburgh and
4 it happens all around the country.

5 And not only that, it will ruin our
6 economy as well. It will ruin the - it will - it
7 will make the living conditions for the lower class
8 much worse. While - while promoting a tax increase
9 due to the government needing more funding to
10 actually provide for our necessities. And we're
11 already seeing instances of this. Just recently it
12 was covered that water is, like, going in to trade
13 on Wall Street, when it's such a basic necessity for
14 life.

15 And, like, things like this just
16 kind of terrify me and everyone else my age going
17 into the future. We should be, like, we should be
18 facing this and trying to help it - we should be
19 trying to make this world a better place. Because
20 it's not - it's probably not - it's not too late to
21 do that. And it's - it's - it's something that's
22 actually happening. We can see the effects in front
23 of us. There is more than enough evidence and
24 denial is just futile. Like, we are watching the
25 world slowly die around us. And it's terrifying.

1 In a few years, outdoor activities are
2 going to be impossible. Like, space is not a viable
3 option anytime soon. We need to save this planet
4 while we have it. And in order to do that we need
5 to pass - we need to help Pennsylvania going into
6 RGGI to make the progress that we need done. Thank
7 you.

8 CHAIR: Thank you, Jack.

9 Next, we have number ten, Joe Cullen.
10 Do we have Joe?

11 MR. CULLEN: Yes, you do. Thank you
12 very much for un-muting me there. I wasn't sure
13 what the function was. So - great. So my name is
14 Joe Cullen. It's C-U-L-L-E-N. And I am here
15 representing today the Building Performance
16 Association. And the Building Performance
17 Association is based in Moon Township, Pennsylvania,
18 in western Pennsylvania. And I grew up in Scranton,
19 Pennsylvania. And so both as an organization and
20 personally we care deeply about Pennsylvania's
21 economy and climate.

22 So - so first of all, I just wanted to
23 thank you for providing this opportunity to testify.

24 And we submitted our written comments to reg
25 comments at PA.gov. And so any of the materials I

1 don't get to cover in the five minutes will be
2 submitted and attached to that document. But our
3 basic overall comment is the Building Performance
4 Association wholeheartedly supports the adoption of
5 the carbon dioxide budget trading program, which
6 everyone commonly refers to as RGGI.

7 It is the great tool in the toolbox
8 for accomplishing a lot of goals that the
9 Commonwealth holds. I am going to focus on jobs.
10 But we wholeheartedly agree with the health and
11 environmental benefits that many of the speakers
12 before me and I am sure many after will refer to.

13 So just very quickly, who is the
14 Building Performance Association? We're a trade
15 association and we focus on home and building
16 performance industry. Mostly energy efficiency
17 retrofits to improve health, safety and
18 environmental outcomes. We work mostly with
19 performance contractors, weatherization agencies,
20 training centers, energy efficiency manufacturers
21 and suppliers and small businesses. But we work
22 with many local non-profits, including KEA and other
23 advocates in Pennsylvania. And we're happy to work
24 with them.

25 We have 748 members in Pennsylvania,

1 all of whom sort of work on the nuts and bolts of
2 installing energy efficiency features to buildings.

3 And we represent 11,000 members nationwide.

4 So what I wanted to emphasize is jobs.

5 And I'll apologize in advance for sounding like a
6 johnny-one-note on jobs because there are many
7 benefits of joining RGGI. But I really want to talk
8 about jobs, because that's one of the focuses of our
9 association.

10 Many folks refer to energy efficiency
11 as kind of the Rodney Dangerfield of clean energy.
12 It is where most of the jobs in clean energy in
13 virtually all of the states are located.
14 Pennsylvania, for example, in 2019 there were 68,820
15 energy efficiency jobs. That is larger than any
16 other energy sector in Pennsylvania. And it is very
17 encouraging that that sector, at least pre-COVID,
18 was growing faster than any other clean energy job
19 sector in Pennsylvania.

20 But our biggest concern with
21 Pennsylvania is outlining our comments. And we took
22 a look at the energy efficiency jobs in America
23 report. I'll refer to the 2019 report but there is
24 a brand new report out and encourage you to go and
25 take a look at it. The reference is in our

1 comments. But when you look at per capita
2 employment throughout the United States,
3 Pennsylvania is in 41st place. We believe
4 Pennsylvania can do better, neighboring Maryland,
5 with half of the population, that's the same number
6 of jobs.

7 So in Erie Pennsylvania with the right
8 policies, like those including RGGI, could double
9 the number of jobs in energy efficiency. And even
10 neighbors that aren't involved in climate issues
11 like Indiana and Ohio are ahead of Pennsylvania. So
12 our main comment to opponents of RGGI would be,
13 what's your plan? There are lots of tools in the
14 toolbox to increase clean energy jobs and energy
15 efficiency jobs.

16 And so our biggest ask is that you
17 consider that or other options. We think RGGI is a
18 great option. We've seen it work in other states.
19 It helps with financing and encouraging energy
20 efficiency programs. But it adds many, many other
21 benefits to the economy. So we wanted to thank you
22 for this opportunity again. We believe that the job
23 benefits of RGGI are outstanding and look forward to
24 working with Pennsylvanians to increase jobs.

25 CHAIR: Thank you, Joseph.

1 Next, we have number 11, C. Baird
2 Brown. Do we have Baird on the line?

3 MR. BROWN: Can you hear me?

4 CHAIR: Yes, I can hear you.

5 MR. BROWN: Great.

6 Hello, I am Baird Brown, that's B-R-O-
7 W-N. I am in Philadelphia. I am an energy lawyer,
8 focused on projects, programs and advocacy to combat
9 climate change. I formed my firm, ECON Law, after
10 35 years in national Philadelphia based law firms.
11 And my work ranges from individual solar projects to
12 government sponsored energy efficiency programs to
13 advocating for micro-grid tariffs before utility
14 commissions in California and the like.

15 I strongly support Pennsylvania
16 joining RGGI for reasons you've heard from many
17 others. RGGI is a promising first step to putting a
18 price on carbon. Not really big enough to move the
19 deal a lot, but a beginning. And I want to focus on
20 what RGGI has accomplished in multiple states,
21 growing resilient, green economies.

22 In the wake of COVID-19 we must fund
23 sustainable economic and job growth. Jobs and
24 energy efficiency in renewable energy, my apologies
25 to Joe, already outpace jobs in the fossil fuel

1 sector by more than 50 percent and are growing
2 faster. And energy efficiency workers are in short
3 supply. And clean energy jobs pay substantially
4 better than the national median wage. And these
5 jobs can't be exported.

6 I represent the Delaware Sustainable
7 Energy Utility, the SEU, which was formed in 2007
8 and has been funded by an ongoing legislative
9 commitment of half of Delaware's RGGI auction
10 proceeds each year. Delaware's population is only
11 about 800,000. But the SEU has made an astonishing
12 impact on the Delaware economy.

13 For 2019 it reports these statewide
14 programs: Energy assessments for homes, businesses,
15 non-profits and governments, Z mod, I love this one,
16 which assists folks in acquiring small, zero energy,
17 modular homes built in Delaware, Pre-weatherization
18 program which enables folks, low income folks, to
19 qualify for the federal weatherization assistance
20 program, because for example if your roof leaks
21 you're not qualified for WRAP. But this program
22 will fix your roof leak and then you can qualify for
23 the federal funding, Loan programs for residential
24 solar, for energy improvements for businesses,
25 farms, non-profits, schools and local governments,

1 Mini-grants to schools for student eco-action and
2 green team projects, Specific clean energy programs
3 for farms, multi-family housing and places of
4 worship, Programs to provide outdoor LED lighting on
5 homes to increase neighborhood safety and finally,
6 energy savings performance contracting for major
7 self-funding energy efficiency projects using tax
8 exempt finance.

9 I have been directly involved with
10 this latter program. In 2011, we did a poled
11 financing of nearly \$70,000,000 for six state
12 agencies and two Delaware colleges. The aggregate
13 energy savings in excess of the debt service are
14 over \$30,000,000. We refinanced that deal this year
15 for a further ten percent in savings. In 2019, we
16 sold another \$20,000,000 in bonds for three other
17 projects, including two school districts.

18 The SEU has now created a tax exempt
19 lease program for these projects and we closed two
20 more projects this year. RGGI monies sets these
21 programs up. It allowed the SEU to make bridge
22 loans in some cases and has provided for
23 construction management services. But this small
24 amount of RGGI funding has now leveraged over
25 \$100,000,000 in private capital for these programs.

1 The SEU has also collected job reports for just the
2 2019 bond issue and it resulted in the equivalent of
3 22 full-time jobs, that one single program.

4 Pennsylvania can do the same. I think
5 you heard yesterday from Emily Shapira, the
6 president of the Philadelphia Energy Authority.
7 It's taken a small amount of funding from the city
8 and it is well on its way to its goals of investing
9 one billion in creating over 10,000 jobs in over ten
10 years. Please adopt RGGI. It will start us on a
11 path to de-carbonize. Put the auction revenues in
12 the clean air fund, as you plan. And find agencies
13 that can really deliver on leveraging those funds to
14 rebuild a cleaner, more sustainable, Pennsylvania
15 economy. I thank you very much.

16 CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Brown. Next,
17 we have number 12, Veronica Coptis.

18 MS. COPTIS: Hello?

19 CHAIR: Hi, Veronica. Yep, we can
20 hear you great.

21 MS. COPTIS: So hello, I am Veronica
22 Coptis, C-O-P-T-I-S. And I live at 408 North 88
23 Road in Carmichaels, Pennsylvania, the very
24 southwestern corner of the state in Green County.
25 And I grew up on the western side of the county,

1 actually, next to the large underground mining
2 operation in the state. But more importantly, I am
3 a mother of two feisty young girls, a one year old
4 and a four year old. And we live surrounded by one
5 active gas fired power plant, one in construction,
6 another being permitted and the remaining waste from
7 a shut down coal fired power plant. And all of
8 these are within a few miles from one another --- of
9 each other.

10 I am also acutely aware of the
11 benefits coal and gas provides our economy. But
12 also the cost that they have externalized onto our
13 communities and the economic instability that they
14 are facing right now that could bankrupt our local
15 governments and school districts with a loss of tax
16 revenues from their operations and property
17 holdings. Joining RGGI for the Commonwealth is one
18 small step in the right direction of taking climate
19 action. But the state must also ensure that this
20 regulation does not have gaps or holes in it that
21 are still unfairly increasing the burdens on
22 environmental justice communities, like the one that
23 I live in.

24 As the state implements RGGI, it must
25 consider the following to increase equities in

1 communities across the Commonwealth that have taken
2 on more of the burden from the extraction and use of
3 fossil fuels historically. Environmental justice --
4 --- and these are the things, Environmental justice
5 communities who do not see an immediate decrease in
6 emission levels should receive no less than 50
7 percent of the funds generated from RGGI to fund
8 environmental and health mitigation projects.

9 And these projects should be
10 prioritized in these communities where emission
11 levels are not decreased in the first five years
12 under RGGI. Projects such as, but not limited to,
13 solar powered infrastructure, home weatherization
14 and utility credits. So these communities are
15 receiving a financial benefit when they're not
16 receiving a decrease in their emissions.

17 The rules should also contain specific
18 mechanisms to study the impacts and adjustment for
19 effects that are unexpected or undesirable. A vague
20 commitment to the concept of adopted management is
21 not sufficient. Specific mandatory follow-up
22 measures must be integrated into the regulation
23 where possible. We know there are often unforeseen
24 flaws that require modification after a system like
25 RGGI is in place. And that is why it is essential

1 to conduct appropriate studies and report the
2 findings to the public.

3 And the Department should not allow
4 coal based fire power plants and combined heat and
5 power energy sources to externalize the pollution
6 costs completely. Instead, the rules should reflect
7 that such power sources be charged a reduced rates
8 for emission allowance. Here, the goal is lowering
9 emission levels and generating funds are both met
10 without the burden of pollution falling on the state
11 and the taxpayers.

12 And then we must also ensure RGGI does
13 not unfairly displace workers in the fossil fuel
14 industry. My husband worked in the coal mining
15 industry for two and a half years. And so we must
16 ensure that the projects, RGGI's projected 27,000
17 jobs that can boost the economy by nearly two
18 billion dollars between now and 2030 are placed with
19 workers who need to transition out of dirty energy
20 jobs and the facilities must be located in
21 communities whose tax revenues are displaced.

22 In addition, the investment into our
23 jobs must not go into another dirty industry based
24 on extracted practices and boom and bust cycles,
25 like fracking and plastic generation and burning of

1 plastics. Our communities are having to transition
2 their economies away from dirty energy and we have
3 one shot to ensure that this transition is done
4 right by investing in regenerative and sustainable
5 economies.

6 I appreciate the opportunity to give
7 comments. I encourage you to listen deeply to what
8 folks are sharing during these hearings. And know
9 that this has to be the first step on climate action
10 for the state and not the final one. I want to be
11 proud, to raise my kids in Pennsylvania, instead of
12 worrying about their health, their access to quality
13 education and their economic future. Thank you.

14 CHAIR: Thank you, Veronica.

15 Next, we have number 13, Pat Lodges.
16 Do we have Pat on the line?

17 MR. JAGIELA: We did have her on the
18 line. I don't see her right now.

19 CHAIR: All right.

20 We will come back if we can find Pat.
21 Number 14, Heaven Sensky.

22 MS. SENSKY: Hello. Thank you for
23 having me. My name is Heaven Sensky, and I am
24 speaking today as a resident. But I must share that
25 I am also a community organizer in Washington and

1 Green County around issues of fossil fuel
2 extraction. And the reason I want to share that is
3 because I have a unique opportunity of a window into
4 the needs of what folks that live on the frontlines
5 of fossil fuel extraction experience and need at
6 this time.

7 And it has been mentioned before, I'm
8 sure, but Pennsylvania is a large contributor to
9 greenhouse gases, including methane and carbon.
10 Where I sit right now is the most fracked county in
11 the state. And our service area that I work with
12 folks under includes the largest coal processing
13 plant in North America.

14 The reason I bring that up is because
15 I think it's very important that we really consider
16 how RGGI will be impacting the people that live near
17 here. As RGGI is implemented, we could see more
18 pollution in the --- in our communities. This means
19 that the communities that are already feeling the
20 largest impacts of fossil fuel extraction in
21 Pennsylvania could see increases in pollution
22 because of RGGI. And so I am recommending that we
23 do not allow coal waste fired power plants to
24 operate under RGGI at no cost, as it stands.

25 We need creative solutions. Right now

1 if I drive past a well pad or a coal operation, it
2 is most likely that they are using solar panels to
3 power their operations. That is the truth and it is
4 asinine. And the reason that I say that is because
5 if the company knows that solar power and energy is
6 the best route for them to operate, then we should
7 know that too. We need creative solutions.

8 And so I am asking as a resident that
9 we consider redirecting funds and subsidies to forge
10 real change. And as we concede a market shifting
11 away from fossil fuels, we could make a real impact
12 by shifting state funds and subsidies and tax write
13 offs to actual solutions in renewable energy. Thank
14 you.

15 CHAIR: Thank you, Heaven.

16 I am being told that we have found Cat
17 Lodges. And we will be going to her next. Cat, are
18 you un-muted?

19 MS. LODGES: Can you hear me? I'm on
20 the phone.

21 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you, Cat.
22 Yep. Go ahead. I'm going to start your timer.

23 MS. LODGES: Okay.

24 Thank you for this opportunity to
25 speak today. I am in favor of Pennsylvania

1 participating in RGGI. I am a mother of six and now
2 a grandmother. I live in Robinson Township in
3 northern Washington County.

4 Pennsylvania's participation in RGGI
5 will bring about necessary efforts to curb carbon
6 emissions that cause --- I just bumped my screen.
7 Okay. --- that cause climate change through a cap
8 and invest program. Pennsylvania - Pennsylvanians
9 like me already experience climate change at a local
10 level. We have a large pond on our property, and we
11 always look forward to this Christmas and New Year
12 holiday break with really cold days and nights that
13 would freeze our pond.

14 My husband and I taught all of our
15 children to ice skate at a very early age and we
16 enjoy skating and playing hockey on the pond during
17 the season. But those days seem to be disappearing
18 as the weather gets warmer and warmer during the
19 winter. Our pond is also not as full as it used to
20 be. Warmer summers have made for dry spells that
21 have taken a toll on our water sources.

22 We rely on well water as our only
23 viable source of fresh water. In recent years, we
24 have experienced more frequent incidents of our well
25 running dry. The warmth and dryness have also kept

1 the tick population around us thriving. My family
2 is very used to seeing ticks when we are out in our
3 fields and woods, but only during tick season.
4 However, the weather no longer gets cold enough,
5 long enough, and the ticks are actively present all
6 year round. They seem to be getting worse.

7 My youngest son fell severely ill this
8 June and was diagnosed with Lyme disease. My older
9 son's roommate at the University of Pittsburgh was
10 diagnosed with Lyme disease in July. We learned
11 that Pennsylvania has the most cases of Lyme disease
12 in the nation. This is not something to be proud
13 of. Neither is the fact that Pennsylvania has the
14 fifth dirtiest power sector in the nation.

15 This is due to the limitless amount of
16 carbon dioxide being spewed into our air from coal
17 and natural gas power plants as they generate
18 electricity. A proposal is currently being
19 developed to construct a new natural gas power
20 plant, adjacent to a massive waste coal pile in my
21 town. Pennsylvania needs to move away from these
22 dirty - dirty fossil fuel sources.

23 Participating in RGGI is a step in the
24 right direction and one that should protect
25 residents now and into the future. I hope that my

1 children and grandchildren will be able to continue
2 to live close to me. But I am torn. Decisions made
3 years ago in our Commonwealth have made our
4 environment increasingly polluted. Pennsylvania's
5 dirty power sector continues to contribute to
6 climate change and impact public health.

7 My area alone is contributing to this
8 pollution with the construction of several natural
9 gas facilities that add to the coal power plant
10 pollution. We see more days of drought on our farm
11 due to the planet warming and we experience a loss
12 of enjoyment of our pond, especially during what
13 should be cold winter days. We also are
14 experiencing a larger than normal tick population
15 and consequently more Lyme disease cases from the
16 ticks.

17 I urge the EQB and the DEP to move
18 deliberately and quickly on linking Pennsylvania to
19 RGGI in order to address the climate crisis and to
20 improve public health. And real quickly my last
21 name is Lodge, no S on the end, it's L-O-D-G-E,
22 Cathy with a C. Thank you.

23 CHAIR: Thank you, Cathy.

24 I may ask your name. Do you go by
25 Cathy Lodge? All right. And next up we have number

1 15, Representative Danielle Otten. Do we have the
2 Representative?

3 REPRESENTATIVE OTTEN: Yes. Good
4 afternoon. Can you hear me?

5 CHAIR: Good afternoon. Yes. Go
6 ahead and begin your testimony.

7 REPRESENTATIVE OTTEN: Thank you so
8 much.

9 My name is Danielle Friel Otten,
10 spelled O-T-T-E-N. I represent the 155th
11 Legislative District in the PA House of
12 Representatives, where I also serve on the
13 environmental resources and energy committee. I
14 want to first thank you for the opportunity to
15 testify on this important program to families and
16 communities like mine in Chester County.

17 I personally support our state to link
18 to the regional greenhouse gas initiative. RGGI
19 gives us an opportunity to clean up our air, protect
20 our citizens from the impacts of climate change and
21 move away from Pennsylvania's legacy as one of the
22 biggest greenhouse gas producers in the country
23 toward a fine phase solution to reduce carbon
24 emissions.

25 While RGGI is not a standalone

1 solution to this climate crisis, by incentivizing
2 industry to reduce pollution, RGGI represents an
3 important and necessary first step towards 100
4 percent renewable energy. RGGI represents an
5 important --- RGGI will help Pennsylvanians promote
6 alternative energy sources, create local family
7 sustaining jobs, electrify our transportation
8 systems and meet greenhouse gas reduction goals
9 established by the state in 2019. That is a
10 reduction of 26 percent by 2025 and 80 percent by
11 2050, as compared to 2005 levels.

12 Without joining RGGI, Pennsylvania
13 will not meet even the interim goal, posing a great
14 risk to our Commonwealth. Most importantly,
15 participation in RGGI will help to improve overall
16 public health and quality of life for many families
17 across the state. The Pittsburgh metro area and the
18 Philadelphia metro area rank number eight and number
19 12 respectively on the American Lung Association's
20 state of the air 2020 list of worst cities for year
21 round particle pollution.

22 The DEP has estimated that between
23 2022 and 2030, RGGI could prevent up to 639
24 premature deaths and 30,000 hospital visits for
25 respiratory illness in Pennsylvania. But even those

1 numbers don't tell the whole story. Too often we
2 get our energy independence on the backs of
3 communities that take on dirty infrastructure
4 emissions and pollutions. These conditions can
5 create lifelong health risks, including cancer,
6 heart disease and lung disease.

7 According to Physicians for Social
8 Responsibility, individuals with exposure to high
9 levels of air pollution are at even greater risk of
10 severe health problems from our current crisis of
11 COVID-19. As leaders, we have a responsibility to
12 protect vulnerable populations from harm and to give
13 pollution hot spot communities their best chance to
14 thrive and enjoy a better, healthier quality of
15 life.

16 Children, the elderly, communities of
17 color, individuals with underlying health conditions
18 and low income communities overburdened by the
19 health impacts of air pollution and climate change,
20 are depending on all of us to reduce the harm caused
21 by carbon emissions. I urge the EQB and DEP to move
22 deliberately and quickly on the RGGI role in the
23 interest of real and meaningful climate action for
24 our Commonwealth. Thank you so much again for the
25 opportunity to comment on this important issue. And

1 stay healthy and have a happy holiday season. Thank
2 you so much.

3 CHAIR: Thank you, Representative
4 Otten. Next we have, Dieymadou Barry.

5 MS. BARRY: Can you all hear me?

6 CHAIR: Yes. We can hear you great.

7 MS. BARRY: Wonderful. So my name is
8 D-I-E-Y-M-A-D-O-U, Barry, B-A-R-R-Y. And I am the
9 climate justice lead at the Partnership for Working
10 Families. And I work closely with our base in
11 Philadelphia on their energy campaign. I was born
12 and raised in the South Bronx. The poorest
13 Congressional district in the US and one of the
14 heaviest polluted neighborhoods in New York City. I
15 am no stranger to polluted air and the negative
16 health effects that follow.

17 At the height of the pandemic, my zip
18 code was one of the hardest hit. And this can be
19 tied to the Bronx's operations that have led my
20 family, friends and neighbors who live with
21 respiratory illnesses, which ultimately lead to
22 their suffering and in some instances death.
23 Climate change is personal to me and my
24 neighborhood. And as we know, climate change
25 requires working together on a global scale. This

1 is why Pennsylvania joining RGGI is important to me.

2 We ask for the greenhouse gas
3 emissions reduction but also for readdressing
4 environmental harm that low income immigrant, black,
5 latinx, indigenous and other communities of color
6 have had to bear and will continue to bear as the
7 climate crisis deepens. It is imperative that
8 equity is centered in the RGGI rulemaking process
9 for environmental and climate justice to be
10 achieved.

11 RGGI is designed to reduce the total
12 emissions in Pennsylvania. It is possible that hot
13 spots will emerge or in some cases heighten in lower
14 income and communities of color that are already
15 burdened by pollution. So we may see emissions
16 decrease statewide, while there are actually
17 increases in certain communities.

18 If RGGI is designed without equity,
19 emission analysis might disproportionately end up in
20 the hands of dirtier plants which are
21 disproportionately located in these environmental
22 justice communities where some power producers may
23 shift generations or build new power plants in these
24 areas because it is cheaper, as these communities
25 are publically disenfranchised.

1 Therefore, it is important that the
2 Environmental Quality Board ensures that fossil fuel
3 plants do not increase their emissions. The
4 department must rely upon specific, site specific,
5 data to form the full scope of existing and
6 potential degradation and impose additional
7 provisions that are necessary to prevent and remedy
8 degradation.

9 In addition, the Board should ensure
10 that low income and communities of color receive
11 their equitable share of co-pollutant reduction
12 benefits. The rulemaking should equitably
13 distribute environmental and economic benefits that
14 disproportionately impact the communities that have
15 faced historic environmental disparities to their
16 economic harm or demonstrate community impacts of
17 environmental risks.

18 Additionally, to address environmental
19 harm, investments must be made in environmental
20 distressed communities from the revenue generated
21 through RGGI in Pennsylvania. It's \$300,000,000 in
22 the first year. It should be required that
23 environmental justice communities who do not see an
24 immediate decrease in emission levels should receive
25 no less than 20 percent of the funds earned from

1 RGGI to fund environmental and help mitigation
2 projects.

3 These projects, such as solar powered
4 infrastructure, core normalization and utility
5 credits should be prioritized in communities where
6 emission levels are not decreased in the first five
7 years of the RGGI program. Moreover, the Board
8 should allocate no less than 50 percent of funds
9 generated from RGGI into a new fund to invest in
10 products that will either alleviate injuries from
11 past adverse side effects caused in low income and
12 environmental justice communities or investment it
13 into programs that will prevent future harm in such
14 communities. These would include investments into
15 projects such as renewable energy infrastructure,
16 energy efficiency development and pollution
17 mitigation projects in the state's most impacted
18 communities.

19 I know as a resident of New York that
20 RGGI has the power to increase carbon emissions and
21 generate revenue to invest in communities like mine.

22 I also know that without ensuring equity in the
23 rulemaking, communities like mine won't receive the
24 benefits of RGGI. Let Pennsylvania learn from New
25 York's experiences and ensure rulemaking that

1 includes equity considerations in the rulemaking.

2 Thank you so much for your time.

3 CHAIR: Thank you.

4 Next, we have number 17, Richard
5 Kaplan.

6 MR. KAPLAN: Hi.

7 Can you hear me?

8 CHAIR: Yes.

9 We can hear you. Go ahead, Richard.

10 MR. KAPLAN: Okay. Thank you. My
11 name is Kaplan, that's K-A-P-L-A-N. I live in Blue
12 Bell, Pennsylvania. That's in Montgomery County. I
13 am speaking as a private citizen. And I want to
14 thank DEP for providing me the time to speak in
15 support of the RGGI regulatory program.

16 I am currently an adjunct professor in
17 biology at Arcadia University. I mention that
18 because a large majority of my students across a
19 number of courses are very concerned about the lack
20 of action both from global and local governments in
21 doing anything about the state of our climate and
22 our inability to repair it.

23 Before I worked at Arcadia, I led
24 several environmental departments for several
25 pharmaceutical companies. I have always supported

1 DEP and their good and strong regulatory programs,
2 because I understand that they are interested in
3 protecting the public health and welfare.

4 To have Pennsylvania join RGGI is an
5 important step in efforts to reduce climate change
6 impacts. We are already seeing these in
7 Pennsylvania. These have been mentioned already. I
8 will only say that these impacts will get worse if
9 we continue to blithely, even blindly emit
10 greenhouse gasses at the current rate. Addressing
11 this growing problem is by no means easy. It is
12 fraught with economic and employment impacts.

13 However, to ignore it only begs the
14 question. Because the economic and employment
15 impacts of climate change would be worse, including
16 increased heat related morbidity and mortality and
17 increased infectious diseases, as previous speakers
18 have mentioned. Ignoring the problem does not make
19 it go away, but only pushes the worsening problem
20 off on future generations, as my comment above about
21 some of my --- many of my students.

22 Article one, section 27 of the
23 Pennsylvania Constitution mandates that the
24 Government in Pennsylvania serve as environmental
25 trustee for all the people of the Commonwealth

1 because, quote, the people have a right to clean
2 air, unquote. The Constitution further states,
3 quote, as trustees of these resources the
4 Commonwealth shall conserve and maintain them for
5 the benefit of all the people, end of quote.

6 And it is within the purview of the
7 executive branch of Pennsylvania government to
8 ensure that the government is fulfilling this
9 constitutional mandate. Joining RGGI is an
10 appropriate action because the proposed regulatory
11 program addresses several matters germane to climate
12 change, those responsible and how to go about
13 reducing emissions. RGGI does not shut down fossil
14 fuel sources, but instead caps them, ensuring
15 emissions reductions and a trend to continue the
16 reductions downward.

17 The payment for these emissions rests
18 solely on those producing these emissions. As any
19 product damage liability issue, the damages owed to
20 the consumer are the responsibility of the producer.
21 Analogous leading environmental damages due to
22 greenhouse gas emissions must be paid for by those
23 generating these emissions. Those damaged, which is
24 the entire public, deserve to have those damages
25 remediated. Imposing emission charges creates the

1 funding for remediating the damage, as well as
2 ensuring reductions in future damage by capturing --
3 - by capping, sorry, the emissions and reducing them
4 over time.

5 The reductions over time would also
6 allow the producers to develop alternative energy
7 resources. In closing, I support this regulatory
8 program because it will address a growing and
9 significant problem. Thank you for your time.

10 CHAIR: Thank you.

11 Next, we have number 18, Sue
12 Shoemaker. Do we have ---?

13 MS. SHOEMAKER: Hello? Hello? Can
14 you hear me?

15 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

16 MS. SHOEMAKER: Okay. Thank you very
17 much. And thank you to the Board for listening to
18 our testimony today. I am Sue Shoemaker, S-H-O-E-M-
19 A-K-E-R. I am an attorney --- I'm a retired
20 professor of biology from Saint Francis University.
21 And I am here to testify in a personal capacity in
22 support of PA joining the RGGI.

23 I moved to Pennsylvania in 1994,
24 accepting employment at Saint Francis University to
25 join their marine biology program. Yes, Saint

1 Francis University has a marine biology program on
2 top of the mountain. I have settled into the
3 region, which reminds me of southern Indiana, where
4 I am originally from. I am a scuba diver and coral
5 reef ecologist and love our oceans.

6 And I also love the fresh waters that
7 flow into the ocean from the mountains of this
8 region. Plus, I find the region around Saint
9 Francis University is a very stimulating place to
10 teach the young minds of our college students. Yes,
11 we do have to travel to the ocean to complete
12 research. But this makes our studies even better,
13 since our region affects the oceans greatly.

14 It was when I was teaching in the
15 1990s that I became aware of one of the problems of
16 our region, air quality. I was surprised at the
17 results of air quality testing that was being
18 conducted on the top of Crescent Mountain. Then I
19 realized that the prevailing winds come out of the
20 west and that several of the coal generation plants
21 were located to the west of us.

22 So my image of living in a clean
23 mountain air was tainted. However, my love of the
24 region was not. Instead, I decided I needed to live
25 what I was teaching students. I have driven a

1 hybrid car since that time, since the 1990s, even
2 though I haven't justified the extra costs. But I
3 have joined Solar United Neighbors, placing solar
4 panels on their rooftop. And I know it is going to
5 take me a few years to recoup my costs on those
6 solar panels, but they are definitely worth it.

7 We, as residents of PA, must look
8 forward in solving the environmental problems
9 through these tribulations and costs. We must
10 realize that rising health costs are being caused by
11 our air quality. We must also realize that our
12 region needs economic stimulus, which could come
13 from adding more sustainable energy jobs.

14 I know that I can't teach you ocean
15 science in five minutes but here's a start. The
16 oceans are what have balanced the levels of carbon
17 dioxide in oxygen in the atmosphere for millions of
18 years. However --- with the industry, the balance
19 that was present for years has become unbalanced.
20 Plus, the oceans are acidifying. With more PH,
21 corals are struggling to make calcium carbonate
22 homes. Shelled organisms are having trouble
23 producing their shells.

24 These organisms live at the base of
25 food chains. Thus, complete ecosystems are becoming

1 disrupted. The loss of the coral reef systems
2 around the equator is becoming a real possibility.
3 Having been a scuba diver since '68 I learned about
4 the industry since 1975, I can speak in economic
5 terms. The industry is struggling. These reefs
6 support billions of people, and it is the American
7 divers and European divers and their need for
8 survival.

9 Plus the water temperatures are
10 rising, ice is melting and water levels are rising.

11 The northeastern states are going to have problems
12 with these rising levels of water because of high
13 tides flooding into port cities, PA, and you'll see
14 this with the regions around Philadelphia because of
15 the Chesapeake restoration will do that.

16 I am positive that we can start
17 addressing these issues now and significantly reduce
18 the levels of CO2 in the atmosphere by utilizing
19 science and technology together, we can solve the
20 issues and add new jobs to our region and build the
21 economics of our region. We can meet this challenge
22 through the new progeneration energy we have, the
23 sooner we can make the changes into sustainable
24 energy sources, the better.

25 The sooner we can reduce the CO2 layer

1 in the atmosphere, the better. By joining RGGI,
2 people in Pennsylvania will have a unique economic
3 opportunity, increasing jobs in sustainable energy
4 and we will have reduced energy costs and we'll gain
5 health benefits by eliminating air pollution. And
6 thank you all for the time to testify.

7 CHAIR: Thank you very much.

8 Next, we have number 19, Richard
9 Bloom.

10 MR. BLOOM: Hi, can you hear me?

11 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go
12 ahead, Richard.

13 MR. BLOOM: My name is Richard Bloom,
14 B-L-O-O-M. And I a resident of Ebensburg,
15 Pennsylvania, fairly close to the last speaker.
16 Thank you for allowing me to testify on behalf of
17 myself and the Conemaugh Valley Conservancy, in
18 support Pennsylvania joining the regional greenhouse
19 gas initiative or RGGI.

20 I've got a master's degree in biology,
21 25 years of teaching high school science and a key
22 awareness of our changing climate from my background
23 as a farmer and outdoorsman. I have a very personal
24 stake in this situation. At 70 years old, I will
25 likely not see the harshest effects of climate

1 change. But I have two children and more
2 importantly an 18 month old very precious
3 granddaughter. I really worry about the world that
4 they are inheriting from us due to climate change.

5 I have watched winters on the average
6 getting milder, more intense summer storms and
7 flooding, more common droughts. Like the previous
8 presenter, my farm pond, two years ago, overflowed
9 twice from flash floods. That's never happened
10 before. And this year it's down three feet, again,
11 never before.

12 We've seen planting zones moving
13 north. The warming winters have allowed tick
14 populations to explode, threatening us with Lyme
15 disease and allowing insects to move up from the
16 south and threaten our state tree, the Hemlock. And
17 this is just locally. Nationally we have seen
18 dramatic increases in damages from hurricanes,
19 flooding, wildfires, droughts and other weather
20 related phenomenon's. All of this threatens us and
21 our economy, both in the short and long term. The
22 science behind this is clear.

23 While global warming and climate
24 change have happened naturally in the past, there is
25 no evidence that this time is natural. All hard

1 scientific evidence that I've seen points to the
2 accumulation of greenhouse gasses in our atmosphere,
3 especially carbon dioxide. As the cause of this
4 unnatural global warming, our consumption and
5 burning of fossil fuels is the main source of these
6 greenhouse gases.

7 Pennsylvania is historically and
8 presently one of the major energy states with its
9 history of coal, oil and natural gas. Many
10 thousands of our citizens, including my grandfather,
11 Shay, in the 1940s and my son-in-law today, today
12 make their livings extracting these fossil fuels in
13 our area. There is a proud tradition in our area.

14 This industry also damaged the land,
15 water and air and as a response Pennsylvania also
16 has a long history --- these industries, while
17 allowing them to successfully compete in our free
18 market economy. Through its growing use,
19 Pennsylvania's natural gas has already begun to
20 reduce our emissions. We are still one of the top
21 five CO2 emitting states in the U.S. We need to do
22 more. The cap and trade system in RGGI uses has
23 helped our neighboring states lower their climate
24 pollution and raise billions of dollars that are
25 used to invest in clean energy and related programs.

1 Here in Pennsylvania our participation
2 in RGGI should create an incentive in fossil fuel
3 power plants to invest in efficiency that should
4 save them money, while lowering the greenhouse gas
5 emissions and other pollutants. And they will also
6 pay for CO2 allowances that will help fund the
7 continuing growth of the clean energy industry here
8 in Pennsylvania.

9 There is also evidence that RGGI has
10 lowered electricity costs in participating states
11 and it is likely to do the same here as we switch to
12 cheaper natural gas and solar generated electricity.

13 Additionally, money from the sale of these CO2
14 allowances may be used to help us invest in more
15 saving strategies, helping to reduce emissions even
16 further as well as saving us more money and creating
17 even more jobs.

18 There are estimates that RGGI may
19 produce over 22,000 in jobs and add over a billion
20 dollars in our economy here in Pennsylvania. And
21 this is in addition to reductions and other
22 pollutants, will result in cleaner air, water and
23 reduced management costs for all of us.

24 Locally, the Conemaugh Valley
25 Conservancy that I work with has worked hard to

1 promote and protect the Conemaugh River Basin and
2 its communities. We are worried about the health in
3 this area that is beginning to recover from the
4 historical damage caused by the coal and iron
5 industries. But now it faces the new threats of
6 climate change with its increasing temperatures,
7 floods and droughts.

8 Therefore, our conservancy also
9 supports the regional greenhouse gas initiative. My
10 colleagues and myself believe that this is an
11 important step as we transition to more modern, more
12 efficient, cleaner energy methods as we fight to
13 slow and stop climate change. Thank you.

14 CHAIR: Thank you, Richard.

15 I just want to take a minute and
16 remind everyone to please email your written
17 testimony to reg comments at PA.gov. And that will
18 ensure that we capture your comments accurately.
19 Next up we have number 20, Joseph Croskey.

20 MR. CROSKEY: I am happy to join you
21 virtually today because you matter and because what
22 we do matters. I believe our actions have impact.
23 And some of them matter more than others, although
24 all of them count. And similar to what the previous
25 speaker, Richard, said, we can do better. I also

1 want to applaud all the testimonies prior to this
2 one. It was wonderful hearing those today.

3 When you and I look back in our lives,
4 hopefully we will have few regrets. Hopefully we
5 will be able to tell children and grandchildren that
6 we provided for their future. My name is Dr. Joseph
7 Croskey, Croskey is spelled C-R-O-S-K-E-Y. And I am
8 a resident of a rural western Pennsylvania township
9 called Limestone. It is near Clarion, PA, and part
10 of the Pennsylvania Wilds. And I want to thank you
11 again for this opportunity to speak at this virtual
12 public hearing.

13 I am speaking as a concerned citizen
14 in support of Pennsylvania joining the regional
15 greenhouse gas initiative. I think respecting ---
16 respecting and honoring the places on this planet
17 that are the most full of life, like those around
18 us, the Cook Forest, the Allegheny Forest, the
19 Clarion and Allegheny Rivers, the Three Rivers and
20 more, is a vital importance to so many things. The
21 health and vitality of the Keystone State's citizens
22 and communities is at the top of that list.

23 None of us will regret saving the
24 Pennsylvania Wilds and other vital zones. From the
25 Great Lakes to Philly, from Poconos to Pittsburgh,

1 Alleghenies, Laurel Highlands, the country and all
2 in-between. But we and future citizens might deeply
3 regret it if we don't. Every day you live, you
4 impact the planet. This summer I really found that
5 out firsthand.

6 Like I said, I live in rural western
7 PA. And our water is supplied by a well, like one
8 of the speakers earlier. We didn't have rain for
9 weeks and we, and many of our neighbors faired
10 worse, but we didn't have enough water for basic
11 household use and we had to fetch water from that
12 spring a few miles a way. The farm across the
13 street only one got one cut of hay and they normally
14 have two.

15 Shockingly, I like to feed the birds.
16 And I have a fight all the time with the squirrels
17 eating the bird food. But this year the squirrels
18 disappeared. That was the alarm that woke us up.
19 That led us to provide water from our dehumidifier
20 for the birds in a birdbath that we pulled out of
21 the ground.

22 In addition, my wife was suffered from
23 Lyme disease from a tick bite and every year we're
24 plagued by ticks, stink bugs and other invasive
25 insects that have invaded and survived due to the

1 changes in the environment. So I ask, what is it to
2 be human? What really matters for survival of our
3 grandchildren and other beings we are called to
4 serve?

5 My family and I have resolved to make
6 changes that can have a significant impact now and
7 for future generations. And we will continue doing
8 our part to support a sustainable planet. My wife
9 Sunshine and I recycle, we consume responsibly, we
10 have reduced our plastic use. We shop local, drive
11 less, purchase products sourced from sustainable
12 materials and promised to let others know about
13 changes that they can make to improve their lives
14 and the planet's.

15 I invite you to take action on the
16 part of the Commonwealth to make a difference. It
17 is rather certain that the path we're on is not
18 sustainable. Just like eating too much sugar and
19 junk food leads to poor health outcomes, we have to
20 take action that leads to good health outcomes. Our
21 connection to the earth is real, whether we
22 acknowledge it or not. Everything we love is either
23 nature or sustained by nature. I invite you to
24 discern the next steps that will help us team up and
25 help the planet that sustains us and those we love.

1 Thank you again for this opportunity
2 to share my thoughts with you today. In summary,
3 RGGI is a market based, job creating tool that
4 Pennsylvania needs to choose, because it will
5 provide for a bountiful and happy future. Make it a
6 great day.

7 CHAIR: Thank you, Joseph.

8 Next with have number 21, Dorothy
9 Brandt. Do we have Dorothy on the line?

10 MR. JAGIELA: We do not have Dorothy
11 on the line right now.

12 CHAIR: Okay.

13 What about number 22, Henry Amreader
14 (phonetic)?

15 MR. JAGIELA: Henry left earlier.
16 He's not able to provide his testimony today.

17 CHAIR: Okay.

18 So that brings us to number 23, Dave
19 Marcheski (phonetic).

20 MR. MARCHESKI: Thank you.

21 CHAIR: Hello? Dave?

22 MR. MARCHESKI: Yes?

23 CHAIR: All right. I think we got
24 you.

25 MR. MARCHESKI: All right. Very good.

1 Thank you. Good afternoon. I thank you for your
2 time today. And thank you for the opportunity to
3 testify. My name is Dave Marcheski. I live in
4 Chester Springs, Chester County, Pennsylvania, with
5 my wife Lauren and my one year old son, Mason.

6 RGGI laid out the collective goals of
7 reducing greenhouse gasses to improve public health,
8 safety and reverse trends that impact our climate.
9 By scientist account, we may have until 2035 to get
10 our greenhouse gasses under control. And in 2035,
11 my son will be 16 years old. He will be starting
12 his formative years as a young adult. And as a new
13 father, I want my son to have the best quality of
14 life. A similar one that most of us on this call
15 had in our formative years.

16 RGGI gives the Commonwealth of
17 Pennsylvania an opportunity to lead the nation, set
18 and example and a move on RGGI for a safer tomorrow.
19 In 15 years my son should be worrying about hanging
20 out with friends, prom, getting good grades and
21 maybe Friday night football games. But I'm worried
22 there might be bigger problems to face. I urge the
23 EQB to act now, to afford my son an opportunity for
24 a better tomorrow.

25 And I strongly believe we cannot meet

1 our reduction goals without a robust nuclear plan.
2 I worked at Three Mile Island unit one, as it shut
3 last September. And now work at Limerick Generating
4 Station. And this plant supplies clean energy to
5 two million homes. A proven critical resource
6 during this pandemic that supplies life saving base
7 low power to hospitals and emergency services.

8 We have four nuclear power plants
9 remaining in Pennsylvania. And without RGGI the
10 long term viability of these zero carbon energy
11 plants may be in jeopardy. RGGI would bolster all
12 geo carbon energy sources, create a level playing
13 field to compete against plants who use the air we
14 breathe as an open dumping ground. Nuclear power,
15 which generates around 90 percent of our
16 Commonwealth's clean energy is vital to the success
17 of combating climate change and meeting our
18 greenhouse gas reduction goals.

19 RGGI will ensure that Pennsylvania
20 maintains a strong nuclear place and a healthier
21 future. And without RGGI, my son Mason may not have
22 a better future. So I urge you, move on RGGI today.

23 Thank you for your time. And I wish everyone
24 health, wellness and a good holiday. Thank you.

25 CHAIR: Thank you, Dave.

1 Next, we have number 24, Elizabeth
2 Marks.

3 MS. MARKS: Hi.

4 Can you hear me okay?

5 CHAIR: Yes.

6 We can hear you. I am going to start
7 your timer.

8 MS. MARKS: Great. Good afternoon.
9 My name is Elizabeth Marks. I am the executive
10 director of the Pennsylvania Utility Law Project, or
11 PULP. We're located in Harris - Harrisburg,
12 Pennsylvania, though we serve the state. PULP is a
13 statewide linked specialty legal services program
14 within the Pennsylvania legal aid network. And
15 we're dedicated to ensuring that low income
16 Pennsylvanians can connect and maintain safe and
17 affordable utility services in their home.

18 Each year PULP represents the
19 interests of tens of thousands of low income repairs
20 and provides advice and guidance to state agencies
21 and lawmakers on low income energy and utility
22 policy and program design across the state. I am
23 here today on behalf of our low income clients.
24 Never in our 40 year history of our organization has
25 achieving our mission been more critical than it is

1 today. While Pennsylvanians are urged to stay home
2 and stay safe, the fact is that home is not a safe
3 or healthy place for many in our community.

4 Low income black and latinx families
5 disproportionately live in poor quality housing that
6 is difficult and costly to keep warm in the winter
7 and is often plagued by indoor pollutants like mold,
8 asbestos and lead. These families pay
9 disproportionately higher utility costs, often
10 exceeding 30 percent of their total household
11 income. At the same time, these families are
12 disproportionately exposed to outdoor air pollutants
13 as they live closest to the biggest polluters like
14 power plants, industrial complexes and
15 transportation hubs.

16 All of these factors and more
17 contribute to poor health outcomes in low income
18 communities and communities of color. A devastating
19 reality that we are literally seeing playing out in
20 real time as COVID-19 claims disproportionate
21 numbers of lives from poor, black and latinx
22 communities across our state.

23 PULP serves clients every day who live
24 at this intersection of energy policy and
25 environmental injustice. And far too many of my

1 clients and their children suffer from chronic
2 breathing problems and rely on ovens and other
3 unsafe and inefficient heating resources to stay
4 warm in the winter.

5 On average in Pennsylvania we have
6 over 13,000 families each year enter winter without
7 heat. And I would just want you to take a moment to
8 think about what it would be like if you were
9 working from home and your kids were attending
10 school from home and you had no heat.

11 The proposed CO2 budget trading
12 program offers a promising opportunity in
13 Pennsylvania to effectively reduce emissions, while
14 bringing desperately needed resources to
15 historically disinvested and disadvantaged
16 communities, to improve healthy housing, reduce
17 energy costs and create good paying local jobs in
18 local communities. And PULP is supportive of the
19 program. And we do, we urge its approval.

20 But that said, as with all things,
21 details matter. And it matters that we ensure RGGI
22 does not exacerbate energy poverty through increased
23 utility rates or lead to other localized community
24 impacts. In short to achieve this, we recommend two
25 critical amendments to the rulemaking to fully

1 address economic and other localized impacts of the
2 program on frontline communities.

3 First, we recommend requiring DEP,
4 with input and advice from its advisory boards, to
5 conduct a tri-annual assessment of the economic and
6 environmental impacts of the program on low income
7 and frontline communities. A report should be
8 issued, outlining the results of each assessment.
9 They should include a recommended remediation plan,
10 capable of mitigating any identified impacts.
11 Public comment should be gathered after the release
12 of each report with targeted notice and outreach and
13 impact in the communities to facilitate their
14 authentic engagement in the review process.

15 Second, the rulemaking should
16 establish a roadmap to re-invest auction proceeds.
17 And include specific language that prioritizes
18 reinvestment in locally administered programs that
19 provide direct energy and economic benefits to low
20 income and frontline communities. The rules should
21 make it clear that reinvestment is not about
22 supplanting or replacing existing programs. But
23 rather, expanding them.

24 While I recognize that DEP stated its
25 intent to address reinvestment of auction proceeds

1 through a subsequent proceeding, we believe it's
2 critical to include this broader framework for
3 reinvestment within the rulemaking to guide
4 reinvestment strategies. We intend to submit
5 written comments detailing these specific
6 recommendations and language for inclusion.

7 But ultimately the CO2 program has
8 great potential. And we urge its - its passing with
9 these amendments. Through ongoing assessment and
10 targeted reinvestment we can lift up historically
11 underserved populations rather than leaving them
12 behind. Thanks for your time today. And I look
13 forward to engaging in the process more fully.

14 CHAIR: Thank you, Elizabeth. Next,
15 we have number 25, Nancy Parks.

16 MS. PARKS: Yes. Hello.

17 CHAIR: Hi.

18 MS. PARKS: Hi.

19 All right. My name is Nancy Parks,
20 from the Village of Aaronsburg, that's A-A-R-O-N-S-
21 B-U-R-G, in Centre County, Pennsylvania. I am a 43
22 year air pollution activism. And I thank you for
23 giving me this opportunity to speak to my concerns.

24 Reducing greenhouse gas emissions is
25 the most urgent problem Pennsylvania faces.

1 Therefore, I support Pennsylvania joining RGGI, the
2 regional greenhouse gas initiative, with strict
3 goals and enforcement. And I support zero emissions
4 of carbon and 100 percent reduction by 2050, which
5 goes beyond Governor Wolf's 2019-1 executive order
6 for 80 percent carbon reductions by 2050.

7 100 percent reductions of all carbon
8 is a necessity for reducing climate destruction here
9 in Pennsylvania. RGGI is one effective tool in a
10 much larger toolbox.

11 That said, my first concern is that my
12 research has found that Beaver County's western
13 Pennsylvania ethane cracker, now under construction
14 and with an expected operation beginning in 2021,
15 this facility will increase carbon emissions in
16 Pennsylvania by 2.25 million tons of CO2 equivalent
17 annually. My second concern is the Renovo Natural
18 Gas Power Plant current proposal, which indicates
19 that we could expect 5,000,000 tons of CO2
20 equivalent emissions annually from two power blocks,
21 if it is permitted.

22 I see no indication that these two
23 facilities have been included in the most recent EPA
24 greenhouse gas inventory, which is the basis for our
25 RGGI reductions. These two new facilities alone

1 will significantly erode carbon reductions and
2 benefit from RGGI. I believe that Beaver County
3 should not receive its settled operating permit
4 approval. I believe the Renovo Natural Gas Power
5 Plant plan approval and operating permit should not
6 happen for the protection of public health.

7 It is in renewable energy that is
8 critical to Pennsylvania meeting its urgent carbon
9 reduction goals. Beaver County and Renovo will both
10 stymie a RGGI and renewable energy market. So while
11 I support RGGI, we do need more. And it is urgent
12 that Pennsylvania also devoke its alternative energy
13 portfolio standard, called the AEPS, which is
14 currently 18 percent by 2021. And I suspect that we
15 will need several rounds of increases in the
16 percentage of renewable energy before we reach 2050
17 which at the same time, will allow us to reduce our
18 need for buying carbon allowances under RGGI. We
19 should also be increasing the binding costs of new
20 and existing natural gas wells, both conventional
21 and non-conventional. We should do direct
22 regulatory control of methane. There should be no
23 flaring of methane and that should be banned. There
24 should be no operating permits for Beaver County or
25 Renovo Natural Gas Power Plants. We should change

1 Pennsylvania's fleet procurement to all electric
2 vehicles here. And Pennsylvania should provide
3 monies for local municipalities to change their bus
4 systems to all electric vehicles.

5 Now I see that our RGGI regulation has
6 also included the concept of set asides, which I
7 approve of. But I believe that these set asides
8 should be for the promotion of renewable energy
9 program acceleration. I also believe that for any
10 carbon allowances, which are not used in renewable
11 energy program acceleration, that these allowances
12 should be retired and they should be retired every
13 year and never used.

14 Finally, we have RGGI dollars coming
15 to Pennsylvania in 2022. It should be used for
16 environmental equity in renewable energy programs
17 for the poor, low income families and minority
18 communities. Such as, for example, the southwestern
19 Pennsylvania fracking areas with permanently damaged
20 ecosystems. Renovo Town, which needs electric
21 generation hopefully by renewable energy. And the
22 City of Chester in Chester County, Pennsylvania,
23 which needs to reduce its carbon from existing
24 sources, but also reduce the multiple other
25 pollution sources with impacts that it already has.

1 So, thank you. And I will be
2 submitting further comments.

3 CHAIR: Thank you, Nancy. Next, we
4 have number 26, Dennis Groce.

5 MR. GROCE: Yes, hello. Can you hear
6 me?

7 CHAIR: Yes. We can hear you. Go
8 ahead, Dennis.

9 MR. GROCE: Great. Good afternoon.
10 My name is Dennis Groce, G-R-O-C-E. Thank you for
11 the opportunity to speak in favor of the regional
12 greenhouse gas initiative, RGGI. I speak to you
13 today as a Pennsylvania resident. And I am also the
14 chairperson of a faith based group, the Lutheran
15 Northwest Pennsylvania Synod Green Team. We're a
16 group of volunteers who educate and inspire our
17 congregation's members and their communities in 15
18 counties of northwestern Pennsylvania. Hopefully we
19 reach them to care for the earth and its creatures.

20 There is a line --- actually in
21 several places in the Bible that tells us no one
22 knows the hour or the day or events in the future.
23 In spite of that, still, much of the world,
24 including Pennsylvania, has continued to act as
25 though we somehow know that we have plenty of time

1 to act to rein in climate change. For greenhouse
2 gas emissions, time is certainly running short. Now
3 is the time for Pennsylvania to act to rein in those
4 emissions through RGGI.

5 In May of this year, EPA published a
6 document titled report on the environment. That
7 report confirms what we've often heard in many
8 places. Climate change is increasing floods and
9 droughts, increasing heat related illnesses and
10 deaths, the severity of heat waves and degrading
11 coastal and land based ecosystems, among many other
12 events.

13 Well, I live near Lake Erie. It's
14 sort of my backyard neighbor. I see the increased
15 frequency in severe weather events and flooding on
16 Lake Erie. In recent years I've seen Lake Erie
17 swelling to produce waves and surge water up to 40
18 yards up the beach from the normal water's edge. I
19 have neighbors on Lake Erie who have owned property
20 for decades that is now being degraded by the
21 intense storms. These storms are the worst in the
22 memory of the oldest residents of my area.

23 Carbon emissions reductions
24 facilitated by a program like RGGI can meaningfully
25 address climate change. And in so doing, it is

1 going to help reduce the frequency and strength of
2 those storms on Lake Erie. Several of my
3 acquaintances and some of their children that have
4 suffered from asthma and need regular therapy and
5 treatment. Cleaner air facilitated by RGGI can
6 certainly help reduce the frequency of those
7 illnesses.

8 The reduction of greenhouse gas
9 emissions by the power industry has benefits beyond
10 the environment and health. RGGI can stimulate
11 cleaner energy jobs that will survive into the
12 future, surviving Pennsylvania families for
13 generations to come. The proposed cap and invest
14 strategy as a part of RGGI has worked well in other
15 states in our region, to the benefit of their
16 economy and the environment.

17 You have the opportunity now to put
18 Pennsylvania on a long but necessary path, along
19 with other states, to help lead the world to reduce
20 the acceleration of climate change, while
21 encouraging a forward looking, renewable energy
22 sector that can provide jobs well into the future.
23 Clearly we must make this the hour and the day when
24 Pennsylvania takes this action through RGGI to help
25 prevent many, many dimensions of damage to our

1 earth, including ourselves and fellow creatures. We
2 depend on you to act on Pennsylvania's regional
3 greenhouse gas initiative. Once again, thank you.

4 CHAIR: Thank you, Dennis. Next we
5 have number 27, Monica Byseline (phonetic) Block.

6 MS. BLOCK: Good afternoon. Can you
7 hear me all right?

8 CHAIR: Yes. We can hear you.

9 MS. BLOCK: My name is Monica Byseline
10 Block, spelled B-L-O-C-K. And I live in
11 Bechtelsville, Pennsylvania, in Berks County. I am
12 speaking to you today as a Pennsylvania resident.
13 Thank you to Governor Wolf and the Pennsylvania
14 Department of Environmental Protection for choosing
15 to continue to hold these public hearings, given the
16 current health crisis.

17 I appreciate having the opportunity to
18 share my thoughts as a citizen of the Commonwealth.

19 And I am here today to strongly voice my support
20 for Pennsylvania's entry into the regional
21 greenhouse gas initiative or RGGI. The first reason
22 I support RGGI is for health. Over 100,000
23 Americans die each year from air pollution. This is
24 more than the number of people killed in car crashes
25 per year.

1 Emissions of particulate matter is
2 densest in cities, especially along the east coast,
3 including Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, where I work.

4 The health impact of particulate matter is
5 magnified by the pandemic that we're currently
6 dealing with. Those with preexisting conditions of
7 their respiratory system are even more impacted.

8 The government and the DEP have a
9 responsibility to the citizens of our wonderful
10 state to take action to reduce pollution levels.
11 Analysis shows that CO2 emissions from power plants
12 in RGGI states have fallen 90 percent faster than in
13 the rest of the country.

14 The second reason I support RGGI is to
15 reduce the effect of climate change. Climate change
16 is real. A local Penn State University states that
17 climate change is resulting in more severe weather,
18 drastic temperature swings and rising water levels.

19 In Pennsylvania, over the past few years we've seen
20 larger and more impactful flooding and have recently
21 gone through the warmest November on record. The
22 more CO2 in the atmosphere, the worse our weather
23 will become.

24 The third reason I support RGGI is to
25 increase energy market fairness. PA currently

1 rewards the clean generators of power via the
2 renewable energy portfolio standard. But it
3 excludes nuclear energy, which produces the most
4 electricity with the least carbon emissions.
5 Nuclear energy is the nation's largest source of
6 carbon free power, which means it is a foundational
7 piece in the fight against climate change.

8 In Pennsylvania, nuclear provides more
9 than 90 percent of all zero carbon energy produced.

10 When nuclear energy facilities are shut down,
11 they're replaced with carbon emissions producing,
12 fossil fuel powered plants. Nuclear --- nuclear
13 facilities only contribute 12 grams of CO2 per
14 kilowatt hour to the environment over an entire
15 lifecycle, as compared to 820 grams for coal and 490
16 grams for gas.

17 This past year, Three Mile Island, a
18 safe, clean and reliable electricity producing
19 facility was shut down, resulting in an additional
20 3.2 million tons of carbon dioxide emissions
21 annually. If the environmental benefits of carbon
22 free nuclear energy facilities are not accounted
23 for, emissions in our state will continue to rise.
24 If PA does not join RGGI, fossil fuel plants will
25 continue to pollute without penalty, and emissions

1 will continue to rise in Pennsylvania.

2 Market based approaches similar to
3 RGGI have shown to be effective in reducing air
4 pollution at the regional level. And the last
5 reason I support RGGI, is for more responsible land
6 use. As an environmentalist and avid hiker, I care
7 about how the land and our beautiful Commonwealth is
8 utilized. Nuclear facilities only require 1,600
9 acres to produce 26 terawatt hours of energy
10 annually, while solar requires about 150,000 acres
11 and wind requires 250,000 acres to produce the same
12 amount of power.

13 By supporting RGGI, I am also standing
14 up for nuclear in Pennsylvania. RGGI means
15 Pennsylvania is for nuclear power plants to have an
16 opportunity to compete on a more level playing field
17 by requiring that polluting fossil fuel plants pay
18 some of the social and health costs of carbon
19 emissions they release into the air. Nuclear energy
20 is clean, safe and reliable. And it utilizes a
21 small amount of land to produce large amounts of
22 electricity affordably. This generates
23 environmental economic benefits for everyone within
24 the state.

25 For these reasons and more I ask that

1 the Department of Environmental Protection to move
2 Pennsylvania forward on clean energy by entering the
3 Commonwealth into RGGI. Thank you for your time and
4 consideration.

5 CHAIR: Thank you, Monica. Next, we
6 have number 29, Barbara Brandon.

7 MS. BRANDON: Yes. Can you hear me?

8 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go
9 ahead, Barbara.

10 MS. BRANDON: Thank you.

11 I really appreciate the comments of
12 the speakers who came before me. The only small
13 issue that I would add to that is the radioactive
14 waste from the brine, the radioactivity of the brine
15 waste from fracking, is an obvious bigger threat to
16 our environment much bigger than the nuclear
17 industry is now. So that's just another aspect of
18 the problems that we have in Pennsylvania.

19 My name is Barbara Wendeborn
20 (phonetic) Brandon. I am speaking as a private
21 citizen in support of Pennsylvania joining the
22 regional greenhouse gas initiative. Because this
23 will improve human health and reduce health related
24 costs. I work as a physician anesthesiologist in
25 Pittsburgh for more than 35 years. And I still have

1 a home in Pittsburgh. Peter Sapper, M.D., was who
2 hired me as a resident in his department of
3 anesthesiology and critical care medicine.

4 His daughter, Elizabeth, died of
5 asthma in Pittsburgh in the 1960s, at a time when
6 air pollution existed at a notoriously high level.
7 Today air pollution persists in our region and still
8 has significant health impacts. The specialty of
9 pediatric ear, nose and throat surgery was developed
10 and thrives in Pittsburgh. If the surgeons didn't
11 ask why so many children have chronic ear
12 inflammation or why so many also have asthma and
13 inflammatory disease of the lower airwaves.

14 I personally suffer from several
15 chronic inflammatory conditions. I used to think
16 this was due to the sycamore trees. But now I see
17 that it's that air pollution makes all these
18 inflammatory conditions worse. Burning fossil fuels
19 produces carbon dioxide, sulfur dioxide, nitrogen
20 dioxide, ozone and fine particulate matter, known as
21 PM 2.5, among other pollutants. Carbon dioxide is
22 one of the greenhouse gases responsible for the
23 increasing temperature of our atmosphere. The other
24 air pollutants are responsible for premature deaths
25 from respiratory illness, cardiovascular disease and

1 cancer.

2 Air pollution can induce asthma and
3 upper airway inflammation, leading to chronic
4 illness that limits productivity for years. Air
5 pollution is also linked to mental health disorders,
6 including the autism spectrum. Moreover increasing
7 temperatures produce more illness and death related
8 to heat alone, especially in urban heat islands and
9 more cases of disease transmitted by insects, as
10 some of the previous speakers have mentioned.

11 Increasing temperatures lead to
12 stronger winds and heavier rainstorms, which
13 threaten the physical safety of people and the
14 stability of infrastructure on which their
15 communities depend, which others have also
16 mentioned. There is no question that as burning
17 fossil fuel declines, air pollution will decline.
18 And those illnesses that were induced by air
19 pollution will decrease in severity and eventually
20 in incidence also.

21 Pennsylvanians will be healthier
22 through participation in RGGI. Projected health
23 benefits between three billion and six billion
24 dollars through 2030, including more than 45,000
25 fewer asthma attacks and more than 1,000 fewer cases

1 of childhood bronchitis are expected.

2 Estimates of improved adult health
3 will result in 83,000 fewer lost work days through
4 2030, due to reduced air pollution. An independent
5 study of 2017 by ABD's Associates analysis of the
6 public health impacts of RGGI, between 2009 and
7 2014, showed that states had significant health
8 benefits in the first six years of their
9 participating in RGGI. We missed out on that, so
10 far.

11 As the fourth largest emitter of
12 greenhouse gasses in the nation, Pennsylvania has a
13 responsibility to be a leader in implementing
14 climate solutions by reducing emissions from the
15 burning of fossil fuels. And those other plants
16 that were mentioned as well.

17 The health and the lives of our
18 children and grandchildren depend on rapid action to
19 reduce greenhouse gas emissions and other air
20 pollutants. Thank you for the opportunity of
21 speaking to you today and submitting written
22 comments.

23 CHAIR: Thank you, Barbara.

24 Next we have number 30, Bren
25 Hammerstrom.

1 MR. HAMMERSTROM: Can you hear me?

2 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

3 MR. HAMMERSTROM: Okay.

4 My name is Bren Hammerstrom. I am a
5 lifelong Pennsylvanian. I was born in Limeport,
6 Pennsylvania, near Coopersburg, south of Allentown,
7 Bethlehem. And I've lived for, really, for almost
8 50 years in Tioga County, outside of Wellsboro and
9 outside of --- not too far from Pennsylvania's Grand
10 Canyon. For purposes of identification only I am
11 the vice president and treasurer of Pine Creek
12 Headwaters Protection Group.

13 But this --- I am not speaking on
14 behalf of the group. I am a citizen. I am a
15 retired RN. I have reactivated my license and was
16 working in Philadelphia during the COVID epidemic.
17 Unfortunately, I discovered I needed open heart
18 surgery and had that a couple weeks ago in Cleveland
19 Clinic. And I am recovering so I am not sure when
20 I'll get back to bedside nursing.

21 But I --- I am strongly in support of
22 the RGGI. Like previous caller shave said, we've
23 missed out on the earlier benefits. And when you
24 look at the math we're a glaring peninsula into a
25 sea of compliant or cooperative states below us with

1 Maryland and Delaware, east of us with New Jersey
2 and north of us New York and all of New England. So
3 I am glad that Virginia and Pennsylvania will be
4 joining this group.

5 So, I don't think I need to restate
6 all the same reasons for supporting RGGI that
7 previous people have said. I will say, with the end
8 of frack zone, I am very concern about an expansion
9 of natural gas, because the methane leakage is, by
10 most counts, drastically undercounted. And methane
11 is a far worse greenhouse gas than carbon dioxide.
12 But I certainly welcome the demise of the coal
13 industry.

14 But I will take issue with previous
15 callers supporting --- talking about how much land
16 is taken by solar or wind. These are renewable
17 energies that provide --- that --- that have no
18 pollution at all. There are many areas in then
19 United States where huge solar facilities could be
20 built. And then the land used productively
21 underneath them for sheep. There are many countries
22 in the world that have managed to merge the solar
23 industry with agriculture and the wind industry.

24 I'd much rather look at a windmill on
25 top of a local hill than know than that compressor

1 station two miles from my home, which is constantly
2 exhaling unknown gasses that distort the hills
3 behind it as you look through the vent pipes.

4 And in terms of Three Mile Island, I
5 am very happy to see the close of our nuclear
6 industry, the demise. It's --- it's been heavily
7 subsidized from the very beginning by our national
8 government who originally told Americans in the 50s
9 that nuclear power would be too cheap to monitor.
10 We have never successfully dealt with all the waste,
11 which is just sitting in containers in every
12 different nuclear facility, waiting for our
13 government to figure out what we should do with it.

14 These are --- we have an obligation to
15 the future. And just as that includes getting rid
16 of carbon dioxide and protecting the earth from
17 further warming. We need to protect the earth from
18 the leaking methane from the natural gas industry.
19 And we need to protect the world itself from more
20 nuclear pollution. And I'll close there and thank
21 you for the opportunity to make my statement.

22 CHAIR: Thank you Bren. Next, we have
23 number 31, Charles Glanyer (phonetic). Do we have
24 Charles on the line?

25 MR. JAGIELA: He is un-muted.

1 CHAIR: Okay.

2 Charles, you appear to be un-muted on
3 our end. I'll give you another couple seconds. All
4 right. I think you're having some technical issues
5 there. We will try to get that figured out and see
6 if there is some sort of alternative way for you to
7 join with audio, maybe by phone. Darek, if you
8 could reach out to him? We will move to number 35,
9 Elisa White. Do we have Elisa on the line?

10 MS. WHITE: Hello?

11 CHAIR: Hi.

12 MS. WHITE: Can you - hello? Hello?
13 Can you hear me?

14 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

15 MS. WHITE: Okay. Sorry.

16 Okay. My name is Dr. Elisa White. I
17 live in Indiana Township in Allegheny County. I am
18 an internal medicine physician. And I am speaking
19 to strongly encourage the EQB and DEP to act quickly
20 and definitively on the rulemaking that will enable
21 Pennsylvania to participate in the very effective
22 and beneficial regional greenhouse gas initiative,
23 RGGI. I urge you to do so in the interest of
24 improving the physical, mental and economic health
25 and welfare of the citizens of Pennsylvania, both

1 now and in the long term by accomplishing real and
2 meaningful climate action through Pennsylvania
3 becoming a participant in RGGI.

4 Why is it critical to make this
5 commitment? Well imagine that in a number of prior
6 instances you spent a restless night coughing, with
7 difficulty moving air in and out of your lungs. You
8 rise, exhausted, and have difficulty making it to
9 the bathroom because of shortness of breath, an
10 ambulance ride to the emergency room and later
11 admission to the hospital finds you sitting at the
12 edge of the bed, because you have trouble moving air
13 to breathe and can't lean back to rest very much or
14 very long, despite treatment.

15 Rest is minimal, it's a challenge to
16 even eat or talk or pay attention to anything else.
17 You need assistance to walk. You slowly improve,
18 but it takes hours to days. And the anxiety that
19 the treatments won't be effective is ever-present.
20 There is the concern about healthcare costs, about
21 effects on your family, your ability to continue in
22 your home, about other medical problems like cardiac
23 disease and diabetes, being destabilized in the
24 process of this worsening of your chronic lung
25 disease called COPD. It's all overwhelming and it

1 can really happen again, particularly with exposure
2 to environmental pollutants, such as those emitted
3 during energy production.

4 This is only one of the major reasons
5 why it is critical for the environmental quality
6 board and DEP to act in order to enable Pennsylvania
7 to put in RGGI. More than six percent of adults in
8 Pennsylvania, more than 693,000, have been diagnosed
9 with COPD as of 2015, resulting in 18,743 Medicare
10 hospitalizations. And in 2018, 6,400 deaths.

11 Compared with people without COPD,
12 sufferers have poor health status, need to limit
13 their activities, have 14 or more core mental health
14 days over the previous 30 days and no exercise in
15 the past month. As well as finding healthcare costs
16 to be a major issue. CDC prevention and treatment
17 guidelines critically include eliminating exposure
18 to environmental pollutants.

19 Triggering pollutants that endanger
20 these individuals, as well as those with other
21 prominent medical conditions like coronary artery
22 disease are produced in major part by Pennsylvania's
23 power sector, one of the dirtiest in the country.
24 These pollutants comprise of particulates and
25 greenhouse gasses, and their precursors. A number

1 of which are major causes of climate change. Why
2 join RGGI? Because it works.

3 Between 2009 and in 2014, RGGI has
4 helped participating states reduce power sector
5 emissions by almost half, excluding those the rest -
6 exceeding those of the rest of the country by 90
7 percent. At the same time participating states
8 gross state product and per capita GDP has
9 increased. Very notably, these beneficial effects
10 of reduction of pollution and coinciding improvement
11 in health parameters have significant benefit in the
12 billions of dollars from avoided health effects,
13 have been demonstrated to spill over to surrounding
14 states.

15 These health effects, analyzed in two
16 major studies, include outcomes in adult and infant
17 mortality, acute bronchitis, respiratory symptoms,
18 pre-term birth, low birth rate, autism spectrum
19 disorders with likely causal association to air
20 pollution during developmental periods and or
21 prenatally, and asthma, with more than 18,000
22 hospitalizations and total inpatient costs of
23 \$497,000 in 2013 and with blacks and Hispanics
24 having higher inpatient hospitalization rates.

25 Also notably, explanations of these

1 economic health benefits have been underestimated,
2 because long term health and personal and societal
3 consequences are not adequately considered in most
4 of the outcome valuations used. Plus consequences
5 like improvements in parameters, the ability to
6 contribute to society, reduced cognitive and
7 functional disability and loss of productivity.

8 CHAIR: Thank you, Dr. White.
9 Unfortunately we are out of time for your testimony.
10 But feel free to please submit your written
11 testimony to reg comments at PA.gov so we can get
12 the rest of it.

13 MS. WHITE: Thank you.

14 CHAIR: Thank you.

15 All right. I am told that we have
16 Charles on the line.

17 MR. GLANYER: Can you hear me?

18 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

19 MR. GLANYER: Oh, okay, great. Sorry
20 about that. I was having technical problems. All
21 right. My name is Charles Glanyer. And --- good
22 afternoon. My name is Charles Glanyer. I am the
23 executive director of the Hunting Park Community
24 Revitalization Corporation, located at 3760 North
25 Delhi Street in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, 19140.

1 A Hunting Park Advisory Committee is the parent
2 organization of the Hunting Park Community
3 Revitalization Corporation, a non-profit community
4 based organization.

5 The organization was formed in 1976 by
6 grass roots residents in response to the housing
7 crisis in the neighborhood at the time. The Hunting
8 Park Committee is a grass roots organization with a
9 proud history of community organizing and activism
10 on energy, housing, public safety, youth and other
11 priorities in our north Philadelphia communities.
12 The Hunting Park Revitalization Committee's mission
13 is to build a sustainable, equitable and diverse
14 community in the Hunting Park section of north
15 Philadelphia.

16 Our vision is to improve the quality
17 of life for all residents. We have intimate
18 knowledge of the energy and housing problems faced
19 in our community and what it takes to solve them.
20 And we've worked as a neighborhood entity for 15
21 years. In 2017 we completed a housing makeover
22 energy conservation project in conjunction with the
23 Energy Coordination Agency to the energy program.

24 The project provided ten homeowners in
25 Hunting Park with new white roofing systems,

1 insulation new windows, heaters, caulking, ceiling
2 base boards and other energy efficiency items to
3 help reduce energy costs. This project also combats
4 gentrification, stabilizing low income homeowners,
5 enabling them to improve their homes, reduce energy
6 and other operating expenses and improve the asset
7 value of their homes.

8 Hunting Park, like many communities in
9 north Philadelphia, struggles with a clear
10 integrated set social economic and environmental
11 justice issues, high poverty, high unemployment,
12 substandard housing, epidemic levels of asthma and
13 other related respiratory illnesses, a high energy
14 burden and high crime.

15 RGGI can set in motion systematic
16 changes and structural improvement in our quality of
17 life. But putting a price on carbon dioxide and the
18 electricity generation sector, RGGI will produce
19 approximately \$350,000,000 a year, allowing for a
20 substantial and sustainable investment in energy
21 efficiency, affordable solar, improved public
22 transportation, clean energy jobs and workforce
23 development for communities like ours.

24 It is clear from the recent Arcadia
25 report that RGGI has the potential to be extremely

1 beneficial to all Pennsylvanians. RGGI can lower
2 greenhouse gas emissions significantly, created
3 jobs, as well as estimated over 27,000 new jobs will
4 be created by it statewide by 2030. It will grow
5 the economy statewide as well. It can improve our
6 public health systems, save lives, improve the
7 health of Pennsylvanians by 2030 by reducing the
8 severity of asthma, upper respiratory disease, heart
9 disease and many other health problems caused - that
10 are caused or exacerbated by air pollution and
11 climate change. And it will, as I stated, lower
12 energy costs.

13 Because the low income Philadelphians
14 live in homes in the worst conditions with the most
15 inefficient heating systems, their energy burden is
16 disproportionately high. With Hunting Park, our
17 organization provides building assistance to more
18 than 1,000 residents each year. Our build focus is
19 on energy efficiency, weatherization and affordable,
20 renewable energy. 2021 is a critical year, during
21 which Pennsylvania can finally accelerate and
22 emphasize de-carbonization of energy generation,
23 transportation and the building sector.

24 The Hunting Parks Organization has
25 been doing this for years and will continue to be

1 entrenched. And we fully support the RGGI, the
2 regional greenhouse gas initiative. We work closely
3 with the Department of Environmental Protection to
4 ensure that low income minority communities, like
5 ours, finally have the opportunity to clean our air,
6 improve our environment and train our residents and
7 families with the ability to sustain clean energy
8 jobs and have access to clean energy jobs. I thank
9 you for allowing me to present this testimony.

10 CHAIR: Thank you, Charles.

11 Next, we have number 36, Richard
12 Sorek.

13 MR. SOREK: Hello. My name is Richard
14 Sorek, S-O-R-E-K. And I live in Bradford,
15 Pennsylvania, which is north of Pittsburgh. And I
16 am speaking today as a private citizen. I thank the
17 EQB for this opportunity to express my support for
18 Pennsylvania to join RGGI, our nation's successful
19 program to fight climate change. And I am
20 encouraged that Pennsylvania can positively
21 influence the greater good in collaboration with our
22 neighbor states to effectively address the
23 undeniable climate challenges that confront us.

24 Pennsylvania residents, sadly, have
25 endured a legacy of being paralyzed with harmful air

1 quality. It's been 72 years since Donora's
2 settlement proved the tragedy of uncontrolled
3 industrial air pollution. Thousands were sickened
4 and 20 Pennsylvanian citizens died because the air
5 quality could not support the resident.

6 A sign in the Donora Smog Museum that
7 read clean air started here was later reworded with
8 the attempt of clean air started here. Seventy (70)
9 years later the attempt at clean air is still in
10 progress. Today we have no choice. We must
11 continue striving, working and attempting whenever
12 there is an opportunity. And there is. The
13 regional greenhouse gas initiative is progress and a
14 rare opportunity to have a positive impact on air
15 quality tin Pennsylvania.

16 Having endured Donora, Centralia, Darr
17 mining explosions, acid drainage subsidence and
18 more, Pennsylvanians deserve the chance to
19 experience cleaner air benefits that RGGI has the
20 potential to deliver. Not only do we Pennsylvanians
21 deserve clean air, Pennsylvania's citizens, as
22 Richard Kaplan previously mentioned, are
23 constitutionally entitled to clean air and water by
24 Article 1, § 27 of our Pennsylvania Constitution.
25 People have a right to clean air and pure water.

1 The regional greenhouse gas initiative
2 provides a rare opportunity to do something good for
3 the citizens of Pennsylvania, finally. We must
4 seize this opportunity to make air better in
5 Pennsylvania. Here in Pittsburgh it's ranked F in
6 air quality for cities by the American Lung
7 Association. And today we have a chance to do
8 something positive for the benefit of present and
9 future Pennsylvanians. Neighboring states who have
10 already adopted RGGI are yielding tangible,
11 measurable benefits from their participation.

12 If there is positive momentum, we have
13 to join them. Seventy-two (72) years after Donora,
14 it is crucial that we take aggressive steps to
15 reduce emissions here in Pennsylvania, if we're
16 going to have a chance to prevent the worst impacts
17 of climate crisis. Joining this successful
18 bipartisan program puts us on the right path. I
19 want to be proud of Pennsylvania for joining our
20 northeastern neighbors, who are already yielding the
21 benefits of having implemented RGGI.

22 Among RGGI's many benefits is job
23 creation. And I ask that EQB that RGGI revenues be
24 invested in jobs to locate and clean up uncapped
25 wells abandoned by drillers, leaking methane and to

1 alleviate environmental air dereliction of the past,
2 who have deposited --- have despoiled many precious
3 streams and forests of Pennsylvania. It's time to
4 cease the propagation of that one tired lie, that
5 jobs and clean air are somehow mutually exclusive.

6 RGGI models demonstrate that
7 Pennsylvanians can have both clean air and jobs. We
8 don't have to choose one or the other.
9 Pennsylvanians have a chance at a healthier future.

10 I pray for the prescience of EQB board members to
11 adopt RGGI as a permanent regulation. And I pray
12 for the wisdom and integrity of EQB board members to
13 do everything in your power to facilitate a
14 healthier future for Pennsylvania. Thank you.

15 CHAIR: Thank you, Richard.

16 Next, we have number 29, Patricia
17 Finley. Do we have Patricia on the line?

18 MS. FINLEY: Hello?

19 CHAIR: Hi.

20 MS. FINLEY: Can you hear me?

21 CHAIR: Yeah. We can hear you great.

22 MS. FINLEY: Thank you for having
23 these hearings. I really appreciate hearings on
24 support for RGGI and your acceptance of the
25 comments. My name is Patricia Finley, F-I-N-L-E-Y.

1 I live in Ardmore, Pennsylvania. I am speaking on
2 behalf of the Equi-Justice Collaborative of
3 Philadelphia Yearly Meeting Quakers.

4 The Equi-Justice Collaborative is
5 committed to the idea that peace, justice and an
6 earth restored are integral concepts. When the
7 earth is exploited, so are its people and its
8 creatures. When there is war, the earth suffers.
9 And as climate change worsens, wars are initiated,
10 people displaced, hunger and sickness arise and
11 climate disruptions are exacerbated.

12 We believe the climate scientists,
13 that we must carbon emissions by 50 percent in ten
14 years and then to net zero by 2050. If we do not
15 meet or exceed this goal, humanity will experience a
16 global climate catastrophe of incalculable severity
17 before the end of the century. All will suffer from
18 climate change. But the most vulnerable of
19 populations will face certain calamity.

20 Institutional racism has already
21 harmed communities of color and manifested --- and
22 is manifested by widespread environmental injustice.

23 Continued exploitation of the earth's resources,
24 especially fossil fuels, has already caused mass
25 extinctions and put life as we know it at risk.

1 Conflicts due to rising sea levels, food insecurity,
2 water scarcity and mass migrations are already
3 causing horrific injustice and threatening world
4 peace.

5 For these reasons we in the Equi-
6 Justice Collaborative, believe that mitigating the
7 climate crisis is a moral and faith imperative. We
8 believe, as well, that RGGI is an important
9 mitigation tool and we celebrate the success of RGGI
10 in the ten states where it is in place. And it is
11 cutting climate pollution by a third and raising
12 nearly three billion to invest in clean energy.

13 I hope Pennsylvania can tap into this
14 record of success. If yes, experts project that
15 Pennsylvania can cut carbon pollution by more than
16 180 billion --- excuse me, 180 million ton while
17 creating more than 27,000,000 new jobs and adding
18 nearly two billion to the state's economy. We
19 strongly support the adoption of a carbon locked
20 market in Pennsylvania and endorse Governor Wolf's
21 decision to participate in the regional greenhouse
22 gas initiative, the nation's oldest carbon market.

23 It is clear from the recent Arcadia
24 report that if we adopt the proposed regulations,
25 our carbon market has the potential to be extremely

1 beneficial to all Pennsylvanians. On a personal
2 note, I came to this --- I came to Pennsylvania as
3 an adult and fell in love with this beautiful state.

4 I soon learned that Pennsylvania is a major
5 exporter and emitter of greenhouse gasses, and thus
6 a major offender in the climate change story.

7 Within ten years of my arrival I
8 developed asthma. One of my daughters also suffers
9 from asthma. We --- we strongly support the
10 adoption of RGGI. Thank you very much.

11 CHAIR: Thank you, Patricia. Next up,
12 we have number 40, the Reverend Mitchell Hescocx.

13 MR. HESCOX: Thank you very much.

14 This is the Reverend Mitchell Hescocx,
15 H-E-S-C-O-X. I am president and CEO of the
16 Evangelical Environmental Network. And I live in
17 New Freedom, York County, Pennsylvania. And before
18 continuing the rest of my testimony I would like to
19 thank DEP for offering these virtual hearings.
20 Especially in this time of COVID it is essential
21 that the voice of Pennsylvanians be heard. And
22 there is no better way of doing that than through
23 this virtual opportunity to speak our own piece of
24 our own mind.

25 In addition to being an evangelical

1 clergy member who pastored a Pennsylvania
2 congregation for over 18 years. I've been present
3 of EEN for 12 years. And before that I worked in
4 the coal industry for 14 years, with my last
5 position being in Pennsylvania's manufacturing
6 industry as a manager of fuel systems for Alistair
7 Fuel Systems in New York. There I designed coal
8 grinding equipment and pulverizing equipment for
9 pulverized coal boilers around the world.

10 I am a lifelong Republican, fiscal
11 conservative. I grew up in the small Cambria County
12 coal mining village of Langberg. Both of my
13 grandfathers mined coal and had black lung disease
14 complicated deaths. My late father worked as a coal
15 miner also for much of his life, including as a high
16 school student on third shift during World War Two,
17 before a 1958 mine accident severely injured his
18 back.

19 Today I am here to speak in support of
20 the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania joining the
21 regional greenhouse gas initiative. I am also here
22 to support the displaced coal and electric utility
23 workers, and those economically disadvantaged
24 individuals who are currently suffering the worst
25 impacts of pollution and must be defended from added

1 economic burdens should the RGGI standard not be
2 implemented correctly.

3 For me it's a biblical matter. And
4 the Bible says from Micah that he has shown you what
5 is moral and what is good. And what does the Lord
6 require of you but to act justly and throughout
7 mercy and to walk humbly with our God. First, I
8 understand that there are utility workers and coal
9 miners better than most, because I lived through
10 them and the same fear in job evaporations.

11 However the simple truth is, is the
12 coal jobs will not return. Coal can no longer
13 compete. And joining RGGI will not hasten coal's
14 demise. However, if its highly skilled and trained
15 workforce would quit chasing after ghosts, EEN and
16 its currently now over 23,000 pro-life Pennsylvanian
17 Christians and counting to support RGGI, offer our
18 pledge to ensure the sizable portion of RGGI
19 proceeds be used to ensure a just transition and
20 support new family sustaining jobs.

21 The same pledge is offered to people
22 living with low incomes in threat line communities
23 who have suffered the worst from the fossil fuel
24 pollution. And in addition to supporting a just
25 transition, RGGI proceeds must be allocated for

1 energy efficiency, weatherization and supporting the
2 move to the already less expensive clean energy.
3 It's time to face climate reality. Climate change
4 already impacts Pennsylvanians and the threat will
5 only worsen.

6 When a temperature averages from 1970
7 to now have already increased 3.9 degrees Fahrenheit
8 in Pittsburgh, 3.7 degrees for central Pennsylvania,
9 two and a half degrees for Harrisburg and a whopping
10 4.8 degrees in Philadelphia. We are already
11 starting to see the effects, stronger storms,
12 increased flooding, heat related deaths, increased
13 ozone and of course vector borne diseases, such as
14 Lyme disease.

15 We are amid the greatest economic
16 disruption since 1990 (sic) when the internal
17 combustion engine replaced the horse as a primary
18 means of transportation. However, as an evangelical
19 Christian and a believer in a market economy, it is
20 time to correct the market failures and allow the
21 market to flourish by correcting the market failures
22 of fossil fuel, creating a brighter, cleaner,
23 healthier and hope filled Pennsylvania.

24 For over a century the fossil fuel
25 industry has received help from a dishonest

1 measurement of costs. They have privatized the
2 profits, while much of the cost has been on the
3 hearts, lungs, minds and lives of our children.
4 This market failure continues today as the external
5 cost of fossil fuels go ignored on account of their
6 dishonest measurement and standard. RGGI will
7 correct this.

8 And now that my time is running out, I
9 will submit the rest of my comments through the
10 mail, through email. But I urge Pennsylvania to
11 adopt RGGI and join it. Thank you very much.

12 CHAIR: Thank you, Mitch. Next, we
13 have number 41, Phil Cobert. Are you there, Phil?

14 MR. COBERT: Can you hear me?

15 CHAIR: Yes, I can hear you.

16 MR. COBERT: Good. Thank you so much.

17 I really appreciate this opportunity. I am Dr.
18 Phil Cobert, C-O-B-E-R-T. I am a retired pastor
19 living in York, Pennsylvania. And I appreciate your
20 allowing me the privilege to share my comments today
21 on what I think is a very critical issue confronting
22 our state and region.

23 Since living in Pennsylvania for
24 several years I have witnessed the effects of
25 pollution on the health and wellbeing of the

1 citizens of our Commonwealth. Delivering Meals on
2 Wheels in York County, I see many people that are
3 disabled and homebound with lung disease. It
4 saddens me to see senior citizens struggling to live
5 a full life in their golden years. As an
6 evangelical Christian, my faith shapes and informs
7 my beliefs and actions.

8 In the Gospel of Matthew, chapter 25,
9 Jesus commands us to care for the least of these.
10 To me, the least of the people who have no voice, no
11 power and no status in our society. Psalms 82,
12 versus three through four, directs us to defend the
13 weak and the fatherless, uphold the cause of the
14 poor and the oppressed, rescue the weak and the
15 needy. Jesus said in John, chapter ten, verse ten,
16 I have come to take my life, in that they might have
17 it more abundantly.

18 Now, there are many more scripture
19 that I could share that support the caring of the
20 least of God's creatures, but I don't have time to
21 mention them all. Suffice to say, it is our
22 responsibility to care for those that are unable to
23 care for themselves. And to provide the highest
24 quality of life for all people.

25 To put this into perspective,

1 Pennsylvania holds the inauspicious claim of having
2 the third most air pollution unrelated deaths in the
3 United States, after California and New York. And
4 it has the fifth dirtiest power industry in the
5 nation, seriously jeopardizing the health of
6 Pennsylvania's children, both born and unborn. More
7 than a quarter of a million children and over one
8 million Pennsylvanian adults suffer from asthma.
9 According to the American Lung Association, state of
10 the air 2020, smog levels are increasing in
11 Pennsylvania as temperatures rise, escalating the
12 number of people suffering from asthma.

13 Driving down Mount Rose Avenue in York
14 on many days I can see a haze of smog hanging over
15 the city. And I think, we are inhaling that stuff.

16 It has to have a negative effect on our lungs and
17 in our lives. If you've never experienced an asthma
18 attack, it is difficult to explain. Asthma attacks
19 feel like needles piercing one's lungs. My
20 granddaughter has told me this is how it feels as
21 she gasps for breath during an attack.

22 If you've never struggled with your
23 next breath, you have no idea how scary that is.
24 And also, increased temperatures caused by fossil
25 fuel warming are a leading factor behind the growing

1 incidences of insect borne diseases, such as West
2 Nile Disease virus and Lyme disease, with an
3 estimated 120,000 cases a year in Pennsylvania.

4 Climate change is one of the greatest
5 threats we face. We are already starting to see the
6 effects here in Pennsylvania with stronger storms
7 and more flooding. This past July is the hottest
8 July ever recorded. The earth just notched its
9 warmest November in 2020 as close to the record of
10 being the hottest in years. Temperatures in
11 Pennsylvania are projected to increase by 5.4
12 degrees by 2050. And the number of days with a heat
13 index over 90 degrees is increasing dramatically.

14 In our home from April through
15 December we did not turn off our air conditioning
16 one single day. This change in climate is harming
17 our public health and straining our infrastructure
18 and emergency services. For example, Penn DOT spent
19 more than \$125,000,000 billion dollars in 2018 alone
20 to repair landslide damage. In 2018 medical
21 research concluded that over 27 Pennsylvanians died
22 prematurely from air pollution.

23 One of the state's largest greenhouse
24 gas polluters are coal and natural gas power plants.
25 There are no limits on the amount of climate

1 warming carbon dioxide these power plants can spew
2 into the air. The good news is that PA can reduce
3 its carbon pollution by participating in the
4 regional greenhouse gas initiative, RGGI.

5 CHAIR: Excuse me. Your time is up.
6 Please submit the rest - please submit your comments
7 so we can read them to reg comments at PA.gov.

8 MR. COBERT: I will do that. Thank
9 you so much. I appreciate it.

10 CHAIR: Thank you.

11 Next we have number 42, Nathaniel
12 Goodson.

13 MR. GOODSON: Good afternoon. Good
14 afternoon. Can you hear me?

15 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you.

16 MR. GOODSON: Good afternoon.

17 Like Phil and like Mitch before me, I
18 am thankful for the opportunity to be able to
19 testify. And I commend you for giving us this
20 opportunity to do so. My name is Reverend Nathaniel
21 Goodson and I am the pastor of the Prayer Chapel
22 Church located in Upper Darby, Pennsylvania. Upper
23 Darby is a bedroom community, bordering
24 Philadelphia. I am happy to offer my comments as a
25 private citizen. And one who has experienced the

1 effects of climate control.

2 My belief as a Christian guides my
3 actions. And one of the most repeated Biblical
4 commands is care for the least of these as stated by
5 Jesus in Matthew's Gospel. Christians are also
6 directed by the old testament writings of Psalm,
7 which says to feed the weak and the fatherless,
8 uphold the cause of the poor and the oppressed,
9 rescue the weak and the needy.

10 The research shows that Pennsylvania
11 has the dubious distinction of being the third
12 largest greenhouse gas polluting state in the
13 nation, as well as - as well as the country's fifth
14 dirtiest power plant industry. I have come today to
15 speak on behalf of Pennsylvania's children both born
16 and unborn. My testimony is also on behalf of the
17 250,000 --- 257,000 Pennsylvania children who battle
18 asthma that is intensified by the pollution of
19 fossil fuel.

20 But on a personal note, my statement
21 is also on behalf of my daughter and granddaughter,
22 both of whom have asthma. My daughter, Déjà
23 (phonetic), is one of the 1,000,000 adults in
24 Pennsylvania who battle this life changing health
25 condition. Unless you have witnessed your child, or

1 any child for that matter, you may not be aware of
2 how traumatic an asthma attack is. I have
3 experienced a feeling of helplessness as I watched
4 the panic and fear in the eyes of my daughter as she
5 suffered through this. There is no more powerless
6 feeling than to watch your child suffer and you are
7 unable to help.

8 And since the American Lung
9 Association has stated that smog levels --- smog
10 levels in Pennsylvania are increasing, the future of
11 my granddaughter is bleak, to say the least. The
12 research suggests that over 2,700 Pennsylvanians
13 perished in 2018 from our air quality problem. This
14 pollution problem also includes that which is
15 created by the electric --- by the electric
16 generation industry.

17 As stated, Pennsylvania has the
18 inauspicious honor of having the third most air
19 pollution related deaths in the nation after
20 California and New York. I believe that climate
21 change is the greatest threat we face. And I
22 believe that greenhouse gas emissions, from fossil
23 fuel to the largest contributor to those numbers.
24 And we are starting to see its devastating effects.

25 To reduce the effects of climate

1 change, causing carbon pollution from power plants,
2 the Department of Environmental Protection has
3 proposed that the Commonwealth join the regional
4 greenhouse gas initiative, or RGGI. By joining this
5 program Pennsylvania will join a bipartisan group of
6 ten governors who lead states from Maine to
7 Maryland. Pennsylvania --- Pennsylvania State would
8 create its own program for implementation. I
9 believe that if we are to participate in this
10 program, the harmful emissions would be reduced and
11 would lead to better public health.

12 Leading a program like RGGI, with a
13 commitment to investments in energy efficiency and
14 renewable energy, which would position Pennsylvania
15 as a leader in the growing clean --- clean energy
16 economy. Lastly, if Pennsylvania were to
17 participate in RGGI, it would benefit all of the
18 state's residents in four ways.

19 First, funding would be transitioned
20 --- funding would be provided for transition of
21 workers who have worked in fossil fuel for their
22 years of service. Secondly, support for communities
23 of color as well as other lower economically
24 individuals would be - who because of red lining and
25 other racist acts have been forced to live in areas

1 of the highest pollution.

2 Thirdly, this program will provide the
3 energy efficiency programs to reduce overall energy
4 use and guard against any increased energy costs.
5 And lastly, the Commonwealth's participation in RGGI
6 will allow for the investment in renewable sources
7 of electricity, which in turn would develop clean
8 energy jobs throughout the state. Thank you for
9 listening to my testimony.

10 CHAIR: Thank you, Nathaniel. Next,
11 we have number 43, Lana Gulden.

12 MS. GULDEN: Thank you.

13 My name is Lana Gulden, G-U-L-D-E-N.
14 I am testifying as a private citizen. And I'd like
15 to thank you for the opportunity. I do belong to
16 numerous environmental organizations, to which I
17 contribute. And that's how I have become aware of
18 climate change and all the other environmental
19 disasters facing us.

20 I am testifying today as a mother and
21 grandmother who wants to leave a livable planet for
22 my children, my grandchildren and everyone's
23 grandchildren. Climate change is the greatest
24 threat to future generations. We have a short
25 period of time to make meaningful changes to reduce

1 the damage we are doing and have already done.

2 Pennsylvania has some of the most
3 polluted air in the nation. I see it as an
4 obligation to remedy it not only for Pennsylvania's
5 citizens, but also for the country and for the
6 world. Since power plants are the number one source
7 of carbon dioxide, it makes sense to start there.
8 The regional greenhouse gas initiative, RGGI, is one
9 of the options that has proved to be effective in
10 the states that are participating. They are showing
11 you reductions and emissions, not only of the
12 greenhouse gases, but also an 88 percent reduction
13 of sulfur dioxide and a 40 percent reduction of
14 nitrogen dioxide.

15 These gases, which are causes of
16 respiratory and heart related diseases, have saved
17 the RGGI states up to 11 billion dollars in
18 healthcare costs. An estimated 30,000 trips to
19 emergency rooms have also been avoided. However,
20 the financial cost is not the only benefit. There
21 is no price to put on the improved quality of life
22 of these vulnerable citizens. In fact, some might
23 say that improved quality of life is priceless.

24 Some states saw increases in their
25 electricity rates in the first years of

1 participating in RGGI. However, these costs have
2 been offset by the decrease in healthcare costs.
3 With the investments of the carbon allowance
4 proceeds in renewable generation, the rates fell
5 below their previous amounts, allowing those
6 consumers to save 2.5 billion dollars on their
7 electric bills.

8 For the financial and physical health
9 of our citizens, for the health of Pennsylvanians,
10 for the health of the planet, I find it immoral to
11 wait another day to act on this environmental
12 disaster, which is slowly picking up speed every
13 day. Pennsylvania could and should go from being
14 among the five states with the most polluted air to
15 being among the five states with the cleanest air.
16 Thank you very much.

17 CHAIR: Thank you.

18 Next we have number 44, Dane Winkler.
19 Do we have Dane on?

20 MR. WINKLER: Yeah, I'm here. Can you
21 hear me okay?

22 CHAIR: Yeah. I can hear you. Go
23 ahead and start your testimony.

24 MR. WINKLER: Okay.

25 My name is Dane Winkler. Last name is

1 spelled W-I-N-K-L-E-R. First name, Dane, D-A-N-E.
2 And I live in Butler, Pennsylvania. And I am
3 speaking as a concerned citizen and also am part of
4 Our Revelation. I live in Butler, Pennsylvania,
5 with my wife Mickey and our two children. I work in
6 IT. And my wife Mickey works for the Butler County
7 Children and Youth Services.

8 Butler is in a small town north of
9 Pittsburgh, about 30 miles. Our town thrived in the
10 heyday of steel and glass production, up until about
11 the 1970s, when much of western Pennsylvania and the
12 Ohio Valley lost a lot of jobs. Butler's claim to
13 fame is that we're the first band of Jeep to roll
14 off the assembly line in 1940. President Eisenhower
15 called it, quote, one of the decisive weapons the
16 U.S. had during World War Two.

17 While personally I'm not a big
18 proponent of war, World War II was a great
19 accomplishment for western democracy in the United
20 States. Here in Butler we celebrate with an annual
21 Jeep fest in June. We didn't celebrate this year,
22 but we're keeping our fingers crossed for 2021. So
23 since this evolution of the steel industry in the
24 1970s, the loss of jobs from NAFTA, automation and
25 the general ebbs and flows from the business world,

1 Butler has never rebounded properly.

2 Our property level is well above the
3 national and the state average. But none of that
4 can take away the pride that many feel about our
5 hometown. A lot of people have groups in this town
6 and don't have any plans of leaving. Steel is still
7 produced in Butler and in Pittsburgh to this day,
8 but it is nowhere near as good as it once was.
9 Pittsburgh has enjoyed a resurgence of job creation,
10 particularly in the tech sector over the last 15
11 years, but Butler, not so much.

12 We need help. We need jobs. And
13 RGGI is a program that can help struggling people.
14 If you look at Butler County's job numbers, they are
15 actually a little bit better than many of the
16 counties that surround us, Lawrence County,
17 Westmoreland County, Armstrong County, places like
18 that. But Butler County's numbers are carried by
19 the thriving growth in Cranberry and Adams Township,
20 which border the northern part of Allegheny.

21 If you split Butler County's numbers
22 between the northern part and the southern part,
23 you'll see a massive difference. And I know this,
24 because I live here and I work for the daily
25 newspaper in Butler County and the Butler Eagle.

1 And for furthermore, 8.4 percent of
2 children in the U.S. live with asthma. In
3 Pennsylvania it's ten percent. In Allegheny County
4 and Butler County, it is around 11 percent. And if
5 you drill down to the spots in Allegheny County
6 where children live with asthma, the majority of
7 them are kids who live near the rivers, where the
8 steel producing plants sit.

9 Just this year the plant Clairton Coke
10 Works had fines and settled lawsuits totaling over
11 \$2,000,000 for all the air, water and ground
12 pollution they've been causing. Reducing asthma and
13 living in a job producing economy is only a fraction
14 of a bargain like RGGI can do for the State of
15 Pennsylvania. But it should be enough to join it.

16 I'll give you a direct quote from the
17 Pennsylvania State Constitution, Article I § 27.
18 Quote, the people have a right to clean air, pure
19 water and to the preservation of natural scenic,
20 historic and aesthetic values of the environment.
21 Pennsylvania's public natural resources are the
22 common property of all the people, including
23 generations yet to come. As trustees of these
24 resources, the Commonwealth shall conserve and
25 maintain them for the benefit of all of the people.

1 We need to do the right thing, for the
2 planet, for the people, for the economy, for our
3 futures and our children's futures. We need to join
4 RGGI, cut pollution, leave carbon in the ground,
5 create jobs and preserve our environment. In
6 conclusion I'd like to thank the Department of
7 Energy and our interfaith for organizing this and
8 for allowing me to tell my story and share my
9 passions. Thank you.

10 CHAIR: Thank you.

11 Next we have number 45, Mary Martin.

12 MS. MARTIN: Hello.

13 Can you hear me?

14 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go
15 ahead, Mary.

16 MS. MARTIN: Yes, hi.

17 Hi, my name is Mary Martin. You can
18 spell that one. And I am a concerned citizen.
19 Thank you for the opportunity to testify in support
20 of the regional greenhouse gas initiative. I
21 currently live in northeastern Pennsylvania, within
22 the heart of coal mining and now fracking. So it
23 affects all of us in this area. I am a native
24 Pennsylvanian. I was born in Scranton, moving later
25 to near Wilkes-Barre with my family.

1 My grandfather, all of my uncles and
2 my father were all coal miners. I went to college
3 at Bucknell, obtaining a biology degree, including
4 many environmental studies courses. After
5 graduating I obtained a nursing degree and moved to
6 Beckley, West Virginia, to accept a regional
7 position with Appalachian Regional Hospitals. I was
8 responsible for hospitals in West Virginia and
9 Kentucky, including Hazard, Kentucky. Now
10 unfortunately and tragically infamous for being the
11 epicenter for opiate addiction and mental health
12 issues.

13 I am not surprised. I have never seen
14 such despair in a population. It is a perfect
15 example of what needs to happen after coal goes
16 away. And to have the resources available to assist
17 communities to transition in a way from that
18 economy. This is, I might add, an important benefit
19 to belonging to the regional greenhouse gas
20 initiative.

21 I currently live in a town in
22 northeastern Pennsylvania, where my husband and I
23 were on the chamber of commerce when the fracking
24 and gas companies came to visit and wined and dined.
25 It has massively affected all parts of the area,

1 both the people and the environment. And it is
2 continuing to do so. Fracking pipelines and natural
3 gas are not bad, but they are not the final
4 solution. They cannot be.

5 Gas is a fossil fuel, just like coal.
6 And although it is better than coal, it is far from
7 good. Merely replacing coal with gas will still
8 result in net increases in Pollution. And as the
9 Pittsburgh Gazette wrote, in economics pollution is
10 a market failure. If businesses have a free hand to
11 foul the air, sully the land and contaminate the
12 water the true costs of that are not factored in to
13 the price of goods or services.

14 I think that perfectly describes the
15 current issues with the proposed new Fortress Energy
16 liquid natural gas facility near me Wyalusing,
17 Pennsylvania. Which, you know, in my five minutes I
18 can't even begin to address although I certainly
19 would like to so all --- all of that is continuing.

20 Air pollution and climate change have the same root
21 cause, the burning of fossil fuels.

22 You cannot separate one from another.

23 Climate change is real and it is happening.

24 Although, I hear many, many people say that it
25 isn't. I recently viewed an excellent Webinar and

1 they have many excellent webinars from Penn State
2 extension on our state's rising temperatures. They
3 have graphs that go back several decades and
4 resulting in rising water levels and increased
5 incidents and more violent storms, just like people
6 before me on this have said.

7 Our climate is changing. It is not
8 just the air and the water that is affected by
9 pollution though. In the recent issue of the
10 medical journal, Lancette, remember I'm a nurse. It
11 states that there is an explicit connection between
12 death, disease and the burning of all fossil fuels,
13 not just coal. It also states that, quote, all
14 governments, all of them, must stop investing in
15 something that is a thing of the past and is
16 actually subsidizing massive harm to our health.

17 Pennsylvania, please join the regional
18 gas initiative. We need to deal with our state's
19 inevitable energy transition. It is actually --- I
20 am sort of embarrassed having spent time in West
21 Virginia and here, that we are one of the two of the
22 two states with West Virginia in our area that don't
23 currently belong to it. Like the physicians in the
24 Lancette article said. We don't have to live this
25 way. We can do better. And I would add that we

1 have to do better. Thank you.

2 CHAIR: Thank you, Mary.

3 Next we have number 47, Eva Resnick-
4 Day.

5 MS. RESNICK-DAY: Hi. I am Eva
6 Resnick-Day. That's E-V-A, R-E-S-N-I-C-K,
7 hyphenated, D-A-Y. I live at 2013 Columbia Avenue,
8 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. I am here as lifelong
9 conserver, community organizer and a breather of
10 air. As a younger person with most of my life still
11 ahead of me, I am somebody that is forced to inherit
12 the challenges of increased wildfires, floods, food
13 shortages, of figuring out how to live on an
14 uninhabitable planet because generations before me
15 have chosen not to act.

16 We have less than a short ten years
17 left according to the IPCC to make some drastic
18 changes so as not to pass the tipping point, in
19 which the feedback loops on climate cannot be
20 stopped. Here we are in the 11th hour, our Hail
21 Mary pass. The economy, our conception of jobs, the
22 stock market, these things we currently organize our
23 society around will not matter if we can't grow
24 enough food to eat, if we don't have enough life
25 sustaining water, if we don't have a place to live.

1 The global pandemic has allowed us to
2 see a small glimpse of what it might look like when
3 we wipe everything away down to the core. What we
4 found was essential was grocery store workers,
5 representing access to food. Doctors and nurses,
6 representing access to health. And public
7 transportation to get the things we need. The
8 global pandemic has forced us to reckon with what's
9 really needed in ways we could not have imagined a
10 year ago. And climate change will force us to
11 reckon with what is important to survive on this
12 planet.

13 A lot of our political arguments today
14 will look frivolous. And in this global equation of
15 carbon and looming climate change over 195
16 countries, our little old State of Pennsylvania
17 plays a hugely outsized role. We account for one
18 percent of global carbon pollution. We have a
19 responsibility to future generations.

20 We are lucky enough to have a clearly
21 laid out tested program in RGGI that has
22 successfully lowered power plant emissions 45
23 percent since 2009, brought four billion in economic
24 value. Consumers have saved one billion on energy
25 costs. And each RGGI state has seen health

1 benefits.

2 With a timeline Mother Nature has
3 given us, climate action won't always look so win,
4 win, win. This is a first important step. And we
5 have an opportunity right now to make this
6 inevitable transition from fossil fuels smoother for
7 Pennsylvanians with RGGI. To really invest in
8 community led energy efficiency programs, clean
9 energy, and support an intentional worker
10 transition.

11 Our window to make this transition
12 smoother and not an abrupt disaster is dwindling. I
13 urge the EQB to finalize the rulemaking as soon as
14 possible and support the proposed rule with minor
15 adjustments. Where the investments go is key. And
16 as a Pittsburgher, I know the detrimental health
17 impacts of air pollution in our communities.
18 Particularly black and brown communities that live
19 near power plants.

20 The DEP needs to regularly assess the
21 level of pollutants in environmental injustice
22 communities. And if the exposures are increasing or
23 not improving, the DEP must engage residents and
24 leaders to identify an appropriate remedy,
25 prioritizing the investments into those communities.

1 Residents know how to assess and address the
2 problems in their own community if given the
3 resources and support.

4 Pittsburghers face particularly high
5 energy burdens. Whereas the national percentage of
6 income used on energy bills is 3.5 percent. Over a
7 quarter of low income families pay an astounding 16
8 percent or more of their household income just on
9 utility. And most of that burden falls on the
10 African American households. We know from studies
11 that this burden greatly affects the mental and
12 physical health of families.

13 So in 2018, myself and Sierra Club
14 partnered with CCI in operation Better Block on the
15 Grassmen Green Homes Program in Homewood, a
16 predominantly black neighborhood in Pittsburgh to
17 provide 12 tools and tips to hundreds over the
18 course of the year that helped families save an
19 average of 15 percent on their utility bills and
20 deeply weatherize and renovated 30 homes for even
21 greater savings.

22 We listened to and followed the lead
23 of the neighborhood groups to sign up 300 families
24 to engage the program to use and install tools,
25 build energy efficiency and competency and build a

1 community of support. It is nearly three years
2 since we knocked our first door. And this group of
3 families still meets, finds community visions
4 together and takes action.

5 This was just one neighborhood in one
6 round of one program. Imagine what we can do all
7 across Pittsburgh, all across Pennsylvania, with the
8 investments from RGGI if we really listen to
9 communities and invest in the areas where pollution
10 from power plants has hit the hardest over time.
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIR: Thank you, Eva. Next we have
13 number 48, Clause Makowka.

14 MR. MAKOWKA: Hello. My name is
15 Clause Makowka, M-A-K-O-W-K-A. And I live in
16 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. I am testifying as a
17 private citizen. I am speaking in support of
18 Pennsylvania joining the regional greenhouse gas
19 initiative. I have been alarmed about the
20 contribution of greenhouse gas emissions to climate
21 change for over a decade. Careful stewardship of
22 our planet is a --- is a primary ethical value for
23 me.

24 For six years I have been active
25 politically, calling for steps to reduce and

1 eliminate greenhouse gas emissions, recognizing that
2 the scope of the problem requires collective
3 political action in addition to personal action.
4 Understanding the contribution of automotive
5 greenhouse gas emissions, over five years ago I
6 purchased an electric vehicle as my only car. Two
7 years ago my wife also replaced her car with an
8 electric vehicle.

9 While a good first step, I am acutely
10 aware that the next step requires reducing
11 greenhouse gas emissions from the generation of
12 electricity. I recognize that externalizing the
13 impact for greenhouse gas emissions by putting a
14 price on the emissions is a necessary step to
15 achieve this. RGGI provides an effective way of
16 doing this at the regional level in the absence of
17 appropriate action at the federal level.

18 All credible economic studies agree
19 that putting a price on carbon emissions is an
20 effective --- is effective, while also being neutral
21 or a small benefit to the economy. And economic
22 studies frequently fail to account for the health
23 benefits of improved air quality and the risk
24 mitigation related to avoiding rising sea levels and
25 extreme weather events.

1 Economic justice is important to how
2 RGGI is implemented. Therefore, I favor a rate fair
3 assistance reinvestment scenario. This helps
4 mitigate the effects of electric rate increases on
5 poorer citizens and results in more equitable
6 sharing of the economic impact of reducing carbon
7 emissions to support citizens of lower per capita
8 emissions. Thank you for hearing my testimony in
9 support of Pennsylvania joining RGGI.

10 CHAIR: Thank you, Claus.

11 Next, we have number 49. Myrna Litman
12 Rubenstein.

13 MS. RUBENSTEIN: Hello.

14 CHAIR: Hi.

15 MS. RUBENSTEIN: Can you hear me?

16 CHAIR: Yes, you sound great.

17 MS. RUBENSTEIN: Fantastic. Good
18 afternoon. Thank you for giving me the opportunity
19 to speak in support of RGGI. My name is Myrna
20 Rubenstein, M-Y-R-N-A, Rubenstein, R-U-B-E-N-S-T-E-
21 I-N. And I am a retired editor. I have lived in
22 Pennsylvania most of my adult life. I am a resident
23 of upper Allen Township, Cumberland County, and am
24 well aware that the climate here is changing. This
25 morning when I looked over my rose bushes, they were

1 still producing new leaves and rose buds in the
2 second week of December.

3 For many years I was only vaguely
4 aware of climate change. But when I was getting
5 ready for work one morning during the early 1990's a
6 segment on a TV news program caught my eye. I
7 learned about steadily rising temperatures worldwide
8 caused by fossil fuel emissions, by greenhouse
9 gasses, and learned that unless we take action,
10 animals, people and plants would die off. And
11 eventually our planet would become unable to support
12 life.

13 And I thought that won't happen
14 anytime soon. I don't have to worry about something
15 that won't happen for hundreds of years. Was I
16 wrong. I started noticing that central
17 Pennsylvania's winters were getting warmer and the
18 summers much hotter. One year my Pieris bush
19 started blooming in mid-February. Then I found I
20 could no longer grow herbs on my deck anymore, even
21 when I watered them and tried to shade --- watered
22 them more and tried to shade them, but the heat
23 killed them.

24 I started reading about children
25 suffering from severe asthma. Asthma aggravated by

1 air filled with fossil fuel emissions. I heard that
2 the clean air board of central Pennsylvania was
3 trying to take steps to reduce emissions polluting
4 the area in Carlisle Borough. Pollution worsened by
5 trucks emitting tailpipe fumes while idling in
6 stalled traffic on the town's narrow streets.

7 There is much more that I could say
8 about environmental degradation, negative health
9 outcomes and climate chaos. But time is short. To
10 keep it simple, it's all related to particulates and
11 greenhouse gasses caused by burning fossil fuels and
12 releasing them into the air. And we must take steps
13 now, not in 50 years, not in 100 years, now.
14 Because if we wait, it will be too late. Too late
15 for my grandchildren and yours.

16 That is why we need to join RGGI. It
17 is an important step that we can take toward
18 reducing fossil fuel emissions that kill more and
19 more of us, unless we act. RGGI isn't new. It's
20 been helping reduce emissions from electric power
21 plants throughout the northeast, except for
22 Pennsylvania, for 11 years. Statistics show that
23 RGGI works. And that the economies of those states
24 continue to grow.

25 We know that generating electric power

1 is Pennsylvania's largest source of carbon
2 pollution. And that Pennsylvania needs RGGI to help
3 us lower our carbon emissions, improve our health
4 and help save humanity. Thank you for your
5 attention.

6 CHAIR: Thank you, Myrna. All right.
7 We are about three hours into this hearing. Thank
8 you all for hanging with us. We've got number 51,
9 Cheryl Wanko up next.

10 MS. WANKO: Ah, yes. My name is
11 Cheryl Wanko, W-A-N-K-O, from Coatesville,
12 Pennsylvania. And I'd really like to congratulate
13 the Environmental Quality Board for making it
14 through nearly 50 speakers. You're troopers. Now,
15 while I'm here today to testify to my support for
16 RGGI, I first want to note what urged me to take
17 this step. And that's the utter disregard for the
18 climate crisis shown by many of our elected
19 officials.

20 As one recent example I was disgusted
21 by the public hearing and Representative Struzzi's
22 house bill 2025, run by Representative Metcalfe,
23 chair of the House Environmental Resources and
24 Energy Committee, on February 5th of this year.
25 Firmly anti-RGGI gas representatives. This

1 legislation would have prevented you, DEP, from
2 performing your job of protecting Pennsylvania
3 citizens from the effects of the climate crisis.

4 In his veto of HB 2025, Governor Wolf
5 reminds us that our state legislature has done
6 nothing to address climate change and has further
7 only created obstacles to fighting this existential
8 threat. And while maintaining the status quo may be
9 fine for the legislators who receive fossil fuel
10 contributions, it is not fine for me and for some of
11 the people I regularly work with, Pennsylvania
12 college students. This is why I am turning to you
13 today.

14 I asked my students about whether
15 Pennsylvania should implement climate initiatives
16 like RGGI. And with their permission, here is what
17 they said. Kevin Thomas from Upper Darby states,
18 the regional greenhouse gas initiative is a great
19 plan that will allow us to reduce carbon emissions
20 and create funding for renewable energy. I am proud
21 to know that my state will be fighting climate
22 change and I hope that other states will do the
23 same.

24 Madison Wetenmeyer (phonetic) from
25 West Chester spoke to me about how she sees so much

1 talk and no action. She says we bash an educator
2 for not respecting nature. We've failed to educate
3 them. We hold our heads high only looking to create
4 new methods of sustainability instead of looking
5 below us to fix the problems we have already
6 created.

7 Concrete, large scale projects like
8 RGGI will help us deal with the problems we have
9 already created and avoid the ones yet to come.
10 Finally, Olivia Carazo (Phonetic) from Thornberry
11 Township states, I think that including Pennsylvania
12 in the RGGI would be a good first step at making our
13 state more eco friendly. As a former mining and
14 heavy industry state, Pennsylvania has had a lot of
15 negative impacts on the earth in terms of its carbon
16 footprint. While we are slowly working to fix that,
17 we also have to be cautious of jobs that could be
18 uprooted. This program allows us to lower our
19 carbon emissions, while still providing our
20 communities with jobs, green jobs. RGGI would help
21 us work towards our state's goal of becoming carbon
22 neutral by 2050, maybe even more rapidly.

23 These initiative would also help our
24 economy boom by increasing state revenue, help
25 families save money on their electric bills and help

1 limit people's susceptibility to asthma and other
2 respiratory issues. I truly believe that this
3 regional greenhouse gas initiative will help
4 Pennsylvania to continue to move in the right
5 direction, while still providing our families with
6 good, well paying jobs.

7 I am asking you not only to listen to
8 middle-aged me and the others testifying here, but
9 also to listen to them millions of young people in
10 our state. I'll close with more of Olivia's words.

11 As a young person here in our beautiful, nature
12 filled State of Pennsylvania, I want to see change.

13 I want to grow up not in fear that my future self
14 or my future kids may never see the earth as I see
15 it now. Or that they develop health problems as a
16 result of us not acting soon enough. I want to
17 create a better world, not only for myself, but for
18 the people, animals and plants that live around me.

19 These are the voices our state
20 legislators should be listening to in hearings such
21 as the one for HB 2025. I hope you will listen to
22 Kevin, Madison and Olivia's words and thanks for
23 letting me both speak and bring their words to meet.

24 Thank you.

25 CHAIR: Thank you, Cheryl. Next we

1 have number 52, Diana Ames.

2 MS. AMES: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Diana Ames. And I am a resident of Pittsburgh.
4 Thank you for this opportunity to comment in favor
5 of Pennsylvania's plan to join the regional
6 greenhouse gas initiative. Thank you to Governor
7 Wolf and the DEP and the EQB for pressing forward
8 with this critically important effort. The extreme
9 weather events of the past year alone has given us a
10 terrifying preview of the devastating impacts of
11 climate disruption caused by greenhouse gas
12 emissions. Increases in the frequency and severity
13 of tornadoes, floods, hurricanes, heat waves,
14 droughts and wildfires urgently summon us to action.

15 A poll conducted in September by
16 Climate Nexus, Yale University and George Mason
17 University revealed that 76 percent of
18 Pennsylvanians considered climate change to be a
19 serious problems, similar results to other recent
20 polls. Yet Pennsylvania's dependence upon fossil
21 fuels has left us with the lamentable distinction of
22 being fourth in the nation in carbon emissions. It
23 is clearly time for action and RGGI offers a well
24 established path for initial steps.

25 Since its inception, RGGI has achieved

1 a compelling track record of success. In member
2 states, carbon emissions from power plants have
3 fallen by 47 percent from a base level measured in
4 2006 to 2008. These reductions in emissions have
5 been accomplished both quickly and cost effectively.

6 And RGGI has achieved these emissions reductions
7 while simultaneously sparking economic growth and
8 job creation well beyond what was realized in non-
9 RGGI states.

10 Besides mitigating global warming
11 pollution, joining RGGI would also offer a way to
12 address additional aspects of life threatening air
13 pollution. The result of the study published last
14 spring by researchers at the Massachusetts Institute
15 of Technology, who found that Pennsylvania leads the
16 nation in per capita premature deaths caused by air
17 pollution, were shocking.

18 The study concluded that air pollution
19 caused more than 4,800 Pennsylvanians to die
20 prematurely in 2018. Pennsylvania had the third
21 largest number of premature deaths caused by air
22 pollution and the highest rate of premature deaths
23 per resident. Why is this happening when clean air
24 is a right enumerated in our state constitution? In
25 closing, I urge that Pennsylvania join the regional

1 gas --- greenhouse gas initiative. We need to clean
2 the air, create and retain sustainable jobs and
3 forge more helpful, equitable and resilient
4 communities in Pennsylvania. And we can't afford to
5 wait. Thank you.

6 CHAIR: Thank you, Diana. Next, we
7 have number 53, Carol Etheridge (phonetic).

8 MS. ETHERIDGE: Hello, can you hear
9 me?

10 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go
11 ahead.

12 MS. ETHERIDGE: Thank you so much.
13 And thank you for the opportunity to speak today.
14 My name is Carol Etheridge and I live in Lehighton,
15 Pennsylvania. I am testifying as a private citizen
16 and Pennsylvania resident, who passionately supports
17 a regional greenhouse gas initiative.

18 My husband and I moved to Pennsylvania
19 a little over seven years ago. Before the
20 restrictions put in place due to COVID-19, we
21 traveled throughout northeastern Pennsylvania to
22 camp, fish and kayak in the rivers and lakes. The
23 beautiful scenery and natural resources that
24 Pennsylvania offers are overwhelming. And I have
25 grown to appreciate their positive impact.

1 Among the abundant resources in
2 Pennsylvania is energy, which provides a vital
3 revenue source for the state. While there are many
4 forms of energy available, we have relied on
5 traditional sources that generate high carbon
6 emissions. The regional greenhouse gas initiative
7 is a cooperative program across the northeastern and
8 mid-Atlantic states, to ensure that we achieve
9 revenue growth through energy sources that
10 significantly reduce carbon emissions.

11 RGGI is already in place in multiple
12 states. And the economic benefit is tangible. The
13 recent benefits to those states are documented by
14 the analysis group in an independent report issued
15 in April 2018 on RGGI program implementations and
16 economic impacts. To quote one of the observations
17 in the report as in its first six years the RGGI
18 program's third three year compliance period
19 continued to generate substantial economic benefits
20 for the states, while reducing CO2 emissions.
21 Previous speakers have highlighted other benefits
22 eloquently. And in the interest of time, I will not
23 reiterate here.

24 Given the current economic situation
25 in Pennsylvania, new revenue streams are more

1 important than ever. And I urge our elected
2 officials to support participation in RGGI. We must
3 not take our natural resources for granted. The
4 opportunity to increase jobs and revenue while
5 reducing carbon emissions is truly a win-win for our
6 economy and environment, now and for the future.

7 I want to thank the Environmental
8 Quality Board and the Department of Environmental
9 Protection for investing the time in conducting
10 these hearings and allowing the public to give our
11 testimonies about the regional greenhouse gas
12 initiative. The deeply personal and passionate
13 testimony I have heard on Tuesday afternoon and
14 again today, give me great hope for Pennsylvania,
15 our economy and the environment.

16 One day I hope that Pennsylvania will
17 lead the country in job creation, health and
18 wellness, arts and culture, and the best places to
19 live. The regional greenhouse gas initiative is key
20 to making this dream a reality. Thank you.

21 CHAIR: Thank you, Carol.

22 Next, we have number 54, Lindsey
23 Blade. Do we have Lindsey on the line?

24 MS. BLADE: Hi. Yep. Can you hear
25 me?

1 CHAIR: Yep, we can hear you.

2 MS. BLADE: Great. Okay. So my name
3 is Lindsey Blade. I am from lower Bucks County,
4 Pennsylvania. And I work in Philadelphia. I work
5 in the adult education non-profit sector, as well as
6 children in environmental education. I am speaking
7 today as a teacher, a hiker, a nature lover and a
8 private citizen. I appreciate the opportunity to
9 comment. I am providing testimony in strong support
10 of Pennsylvania in joining the regional greenhouse
11 gas initiative. I am adamant on curbing our
12 reliance on fossil fuels, improving air quality and
13 halting climate change. Here in Pennsylvania we are
14 seeing the impacts of global warming firsthand,
15 including excessive rainfall and heat waves, rising
16 health concerns and negative effects on our farming
17 system.

18 But today I want to focus on how
19 joining RGGI will improve human health and address
20 environmental justice. As many have already noted
21 today, Pennsylvania is the fourth largest greenhouse
22 gas polluting state in the nation. These emissions
23 are taking a significant toll on our health and
24 jeopardizing the future of young children. Air
25 pollution disproportionately affects young children

1 while they're in their developing stage.

2 This first became apparent to me while
3 growing up three miles from a chemical manufacturing
4 plant that emitted large amounts of CO2 into the air
5 and toxic waste into the Neshaminy Creek. I have
6 witnessed my two brothers suffer greatly from asthma
7 related issues into their adult lives. Not only
8 observing the medical hardships my siblings endured,
9 but also seeing the financial burden my parents had
10 to go through makes a decision of raising children
11 in Pennsylvania's current climate very difficult for
12 myself.

13 As others have also stated, the
14 Pennsylvania State Constitution states that clean
15 air and pure water are rights for all of its
16 citizens. This seems impossible for many in my
17 generation to believe, that that right will be
18 awarded to our children, without immediate climate
19 action. As a young woman considering starting a
20 family, climate change and burning fossil fuels
21 should not be a top factor in my decision making.

22 Additionally, fossil fuel plants and
23 other big polluters are often situated close to
24 disadvantaged communities, especially those of
25 color. These pollutants are linked to health

1 problems, including respiratory illness, heart
2 attack, stroke, cancer and mental health problems,
3 resulting --- resulting in a straining medical cost
4 to individuals and to our state government.

5 If Pennsylvania joins our neighboring
6 states in RGGI, hundreds of premature deaths as well
7 as 30,000 fewer hospital visits for respiratory
8 related illnesses could be prevented. Our neighbors
9 in participating RGGI states have seen a savings of
10 \$5.7 billion dollars in health benefits since the
11 start of a program. So after seeing this economic -
12 the economic and health benefits of other RGGI
13 states, it is now time for Pennsylvania to join this
14 bipartisan solution, investing in sustainable jobs,
15 ensuring clean air and water and reducing greenhouse
16 gasses.

17 RGGI is vital to help lessen the
18 effects on climate change and promote a healthy,
19 livable environment for all Pennsylvanians and for
20 future generations. Thank you to the EQB for
21 putting on these hearings and listening to our
22 comments.

23 CHAIR: Thank you, Lindsey. Next, we
24 have number 55, John Beres.

25 MR. BERES: Good afternoon. My name

1 is John Beres, B-E-R-E-S. I am testifying today as
2 a private citizen from Baldwin Borough, it's a South
3 Hills suburb of Pittsburgh. And I appreciate the
4 opportunity to testify today. I am a father and a
5 grandfather who has lived his entire life, 70 years,
6 in the State of Pennsylvania. In my lifetime I have
7 been privileged to enjoy a quality standard of
8 living that has included countless hours in the
9 beautiful and varied natural outdoor environment
10 that this great state has to offer.

11 I want to be a part of those who
12 advocated to leave this natural legacy to my progeny
13 and future generations intact. Unfortunately,
14 climate change, which people like me, guided by
15 scientists, believe is threatening this legacy.
16 That something must be done about it sooner rather
17 than later. The RGGI initiative has been in
18 existence for over a decade with the proven success
19 to reduce carbon emissions from the fossil fuel
20 power sector, which are the primary drivers of
21 climate change. While also creating jobs to help
22 pave the way towards a net zero carbon future.

23 Please consider having our State of
24 Pennsylvania become a part of this program, so that
25 we can become another of the member states that are

1 already reaping these benefits. Let us be able to
2 say that we have the foresight and did something
3 constructive and good for people and industry on
4 many levels, while leaving the legacy of a climate
5 that will continue to offer other, future
6 Pennsylvanians the same privileges that we enjoyed
7 during our time here. Thank you very much.

8 CHAIR: Thank you, John.

9 Next we have number 56, Anne McStay.

10 MS. MCSTAY: Hi. Can you hear me?

11 CHAIR: Yes. We can hear you. Go
12 ahead, Anne.

13 MS. MCSTAY: Great. Thank you.

14 My name is Anne McStay, M-C-S-T-A-Y,
15 is my last name. I live in the suburb of Mount
16 Lebanon, just south of Pittsburgh, at 1651
17 Williamsburg, Road. And I am speaking today as a
18 private citizen, but having done some work in the
19 environmental area. I am also speaking on behalf of
20 the trees and the invertebrates in the ground and
21 all the creatures that live on the earth themselves,
22 because they can't speak for themselves.

23 As a child I grew up, my father was in
24 the Air Force and he took us all over this country
25 on his vacations. We drove to almost every state

1 and just saw how magnificent it is. And when I was
2 eight years old we moved to Ohio. And there I saw
3 magnificent trees. I grew up and lived in Oklahoma
4 before that, which has little trees. But you can
5 see some beautiful trees in the northeast. And I
6 was so taken with them.

7 Well we --- I have subsequently lived
8 in San Jose and I experienced there what pollution
9 can do. When my parents bough the house we lived
10 in, I didn't know there were mountains a mile away
11 because the smog was so thick. This is in 1963,
12 after I moved from Ohio. And it was so bad that I
13 would get sick every year. I didn't have asthma at
14 the time. But I would --- if I had any kind of
15 allergic reaction or a cold I would develop
16 bronchitis because there was so much stuff in the
17 air that it made it hard for my body to deal with
18 it.

19 So after those experiences when we
20 moved here 27 years ago to Pittsburgh, I moved to
21 the bay area, where I had fortunately moved to an
22 area where I wasn't' sick all the time. But I saw
23 as we drove around on the highways and so forth that
24 the trees were being ravaged by gypsy moths and they
25 were definitely weakened. And as I studied about

1 it, I learned that it was because they were weakened
2 by pollution.

3 We are in the middle of a corridor of
4 pollution blowing in from Illinois, Indiana, Ohio,
5 coal fire plants here into Pennsylvania. So we are
6 receiving the output of those plants. We are also
7 seeing ours along with what remains of theirs that's
8 still in the air to the northeast. So that it
9 caused me to join a study to look at tree mortality.

10 And the west side of the mountains in Vermont and
11 Maine, White Mountains and so forth the trees are
12 dying at a much greater rate on the western slopes.

13 And that's because of the pollution that was
14 blowing in.

15 So I worked with a high school,
16 environmental science teacher to have one of her
17 classes do a mortality study for several years down
18 at Ohiopyle. And the kids were astounded to see the
19 actual effects of pollution, because they'd never
20 seen these congregated stands of trees and really
21 looked at what was happening to them.

22 So I believe that we can mitigate
23 these things by passing legislation and setting up
24 regulations such as RGGI because it will benefit not
25 just Pennsylvania, but an entire swathe of the

1 country. You know, we are experiencing asthma. I
2 now have asthma. When I moved to Pittsburgh, within
3 a few years I developed asthma. And it's the
4 particulate matter in the air as well as the other
5 pollutants that are causing it.

6 I live in a green neighborhood. There
7 are lots of trees and lots of grass and lots of open
8 space in the south hills. But for children that are
9 in inner city Pittsburgh, they don't have that
10 amenity. So and they're close in the city and it's
11 much warmer in the summers so they are suffering at
12 a much greater rate. And it's unconscionable that
13 we would permit this to go on. Corporations are
14 treated as people in the courts.

15 And in law, none of us is allowed to
16 harm the next person. I can act as I wish up to the
17 point that I cause harm to someone else. Well, it
18 is important that we hold these corporations
19 accountable who are providing, you know, energy
20 through fracking and through coal and so forth.
21 They have to participate in paying the costs of what
22 they are --- they are emitting.

23 So we've been - the industrial
24 revolution only started about 250 years ago. And at
25 that time, we have brought the earth to the brink.

1 So it is beyond time for us to make the changes in
2 the way we treat the earth and the way we treat each
3 other. So I firmly, strongly support the RGGI
4 initiative.

5 CHAIR: Thank you, Anne. Your time is
6 up. We would appreciate if you would email the rest
7 of your comments to reg comments at PA.gov.

8 MS. MCSTAY: I will. Thank you very
9 much.

10 CHAIR: Next up we have number 57,
11 Aaron Skiff.

12 MS. SKIFF: Hello. Can you hear me?

13 CHAIR: Yes.

14 MS. SKIFF: Okay. Hi. My name is
15 Aaron Skiff, that's S as in Sam, K-I-F-F as in
16 Frank. I am testifying as a private citizen. I
17 have been born and raised in Pittsburgh. I have
18 quickly learned through living here that this city
19 has the worst air quality in the U.S. of any city
20 east of California. That was a shocking statistic
21 to learn. I am a 22 year old student at Quinn Park
22 University in the sports arts and entertainment
23 management program.

24 I spent a short amount of time in the
25 sustainability program at Chatham University before

1 transferring. I have also traveled to Ecuador out
2 of high school to study agricultural sustainability
3 in particular. What I have learned from my studies
4 is actually that livestock farming is the main
5 concern for carbon emissions. However, the next
6 most pressing issue is energy.

7 I have always had huge amounts of care
8 for environmental concerns. This happened very
9 naturally once I informed myself through
10 environmental readings, movies and documentaries.
11 Our world will not be able to take the exploitation
12 we have done to it for much longer.

13 The other notion I informed myself
14 about is overpopulation and the connection to
15 resource exploitation. Not only are we exploiting
16 resources, but it is even worsening due to the
17 overpopulation of the human species. The regional
18 greenhouse gas initiative will be a smart investment
19 for Pennsylvania and I am in strong support of it.
20 In particular the cap and trade program is very
21 intelligent and allows for the reduction of
22 pollution and CO2, while maintaining and creating
23 jobs.

24 RGGI holds polluters and fossil fuel
25 companies accountable. I find this particularly

1 appealing, because the main issue for many people
2 who want to mitigate climate change feel it is
3 impossible, because we cannot stop coal from burning
4 and sourcing energy for our homes and buildings on
5 our own. We need fossil fuel companies in on it and
6 hold themselves accountable. How else will we solve
7 this crisis? There is obviously not federal help at
8 the time for these issues so we must act as smaller
9 entities.

10 Please consider the issues pertinent,
11 and quite frankly, thrown in all of our faces. We
12 see the wildfires in California. I also lived in
13 Davis, California, during the massive camp fire in
14 Paradise. I actually was a biker in that town. I
15 experienced two weeks straight of smoke so thick
16 that I could not bike most days. I had take Uber's
17 and lifts to work. I had to wear a mask constantly
18 outside. Ironically similar to our current
19 situation with COVID, though completely unrelated to
20 the environment, it is related to human health,
21 however.

22 The regional greenhouse gas initiative
23 is an incredibly important step for Pennsylvania but
24 certainly needs to be implemented across the country
25 and across the world. I am hopeful that with the

1 new president elect we will rejoin the Paris Climate
2 Accord. As of now the current president has created
3 a mockery of the U.S. by eliminating all common
4 sense environmental regulations.

5 We need to take a step towards
6 decreasing and eliminating carbon emissions. It is
7 essential for the survival of our species. We need
8 to protect our lives. The regional greenhouse gas
9 initiative is a step in that direction towards
10 protecting and maintaining human lives and all life
11 on this earth. We cannot pass up this opportunity
12 to take action towards a livable future for all. We
13 cannot undue the impacts of climate change thus far
14 on the earth, humans and all living species.
15 However, we can ensure that we take the current
16 actions now and moving into the future.

17 Once again, Pennsylvania does not have
18 great air quality. Pittsburgh in particular, as I
19 mentioned earlier, Pittsburgh has the worst air
20 quality in any city east of California. I did not
21 volunteer for my home city to be in this dire state.

22 I also did not make this climate change disaster
23 happen on my own. However, I am volunteering to
24 speak up about it, take action and change the world
25 for the better.

1 I will leave you with this. I want to
2 live in a world that is healthy and suitable for
3 all. I don't know what will be happening in the
4 world when I am 80 years old. I just hope that the
5 world's leaders and Pennsylvania's leaders in
6 particular will make the right choices today so that
7 I can live to be old and healthy. And I can feel
8 certain that my children and grandchildren will be
9 able to survive on this planet as well.

10 We do not want to be on the wrong side
11 of history. Thank you for the opportunity to speak
12 about this pertinent, essential and increasingly
13 important topic.

14 CHAIR: Thank you, Aaron. Next, we
15 have number 58, Joseph Kushner.

16 MR. KUSHNER: Hi. Can you hear me?

17 CHAIR: Yes, we can hear you. Go
18 ahead.

19 MR. KUSHNER: All right. Thanks. My
20 name is Joseph Kushner, K-U-S-H-N-E-R. I am a
21 resident of Indiana, Pennsylvania. But before I go
22 to my comments I ask that you remember three names,
23 Flora, Ella and Joey. I'll get to them later.

24 My career started at the company
25 formerly known as Penelec. It was a shadow of its

1 former self due to deregulation. I was lucky to get
2 a job out of college in my hometown of Johnstown, a
3 depressed rust belt city. But within a year my wife
4 and I were forced to move to Pittsburgh when the
5 Johnstown office closed.

6 Fortunately, three years later I was
7 able to move closer to home to the town of Indiana.

8 I got a job at the Keystone power plant as a result
9 of their investment in FTD air emission controls.
10 Things were good. I was close to my family and had
11 a good job. I eventually got a job at Conemaugh
12 Power Plant, which invested in an SCR and FTD
13 upgrades for equal controls.

14 What I learned working at these two
15 plants is that if you had a dedicated workforce to
16 provide reliable electric power, you can compete and
17 survive in a de-regulated market. But I also
18 thought, was that since the owners basically had
19 invested in over a billion dollars in environmental
20 emissions controls, things would remain viable under
21 whatever environmental regulations the future
22 brings.

23 That all changed in 2020 with RGGI.
24 Now Governor Wolf wants to re-regulate the electric
25 power industry to decide who wins and loses by

1 forcing a carbon tax on coal and natural gas power
2 plants. How are Keystone and Conemaugh or any other
3 fossil fired power plant going to compete in a
4 market with seven dollar per megawatt hour plus
5 price added? The answer is, they are not.

6 There is no viable environmental
7 control technology to install. So the only option
8 is to shut down. The electric power industry has
9 already reduced their fair share of CO2 emissions by
10 37 percent, well beyond the PA Climate Action Plan's
11 2020 ruling. Their CO2 emission reductions have
12 outpaced every other industry by nearly double or
13 more. The focus should be fairly placed on other
14 sectors, such as transportation and industry until
15 they are on par with electric power.

16 The public should know that all there
17 DEP advisory committees voted to turn down RGGI.
18 But the EQB voted the regulation through anyway.
19 Why? Two words, tax revenue. The DEP predicts that
20 RGGI will provide over \$300,000,000 million dollars
21 in tax revenue in just the first year. This will
22 not be the case. DEP's modeling logic is flawed.
23 When RGGI tax is added to a station's operating
24 cost, it will be priced out of the PTM market and
25 will not run. No CO2 emissions equals no tax

1 revenue.

2 DEP's modeling failed to account for
3 PTM's interconnection to non-RGGI states like Ohio
4 and West Virginia, who will gladly cover the loss of
5 PA generation. There are seven recently permitted
6 natural gas combined cycle plants in Ohio, ready to
7 start construction when PA joins the compact. The
8 DEP failed to consult PTM to accurately model what
9 will truly happen to individual generators and their
10 emissions.

11 The incremental costs to input power
12 from other states will essentially increase retail
13 power prices by 18 percent per the DEP's modeling.
14 Beyond the economic impact, DEP's forecasted
15 reductions are statistically insignificant. They
16 are only three ten thousandth's of U.S. greenhouse
17 gas emissions and four one hundred thousandth's of
18 the world's emissions.

19 Let your electric power sector follow
20 a broad path for its fair share towards the 2050
21 goal. And if emissions approach the broad path,
22 then implement some type of CO2 regulation through
23 the voice of the people, the PA legislature. Let
24 them implement things like vehicle fueled efficiency
25 standards or a campaign to encourage consumers to

1 switch to renewable power first.

2 Fighting global climate change is a
3 noble cause. But when an approach is flawed it
4 should be called out. Such a broad reaching
5 regulation with such a huge personal economic impact
6 deserves the highest level of scrutiny.

7 Do you recall those names I asked you
8 to remember when I started? Those are my three
9 children, ages 15, 11 and nine. Keep their names in
10 mind when you push this regulation for the wrong
11 reasons. Keep in mind that they are the ones that
12 cannot see their friends anymore and have to leave
13 school and will be relocated when I am out of work.
14 Think of all the other families in the same
15 situation.

16 The DEP owes us due diligence and
17 needs to engage with PTM to properly model the true
18 effects of carbon tax. The costs also need to
19 account for billions lost in personal income, local
20 and state tax, support business revenues and the
21 cost of electric power to consumers. Only when the
22 proper cost to benefit ratio is calculated will DEP
23 see that RGGI is a bad idea and start pursuing
24 better ways to achieve the goals of the PA Climate
25 Action Plan. Thank you.

1 CHAIR: Thank you, Joseph.

2 Next, we have number 59,
3 Representative James Struzzi. Do we have
4 Representative Struzzi on the line?

5 REPRESENTATIVE STRUZZI: Yes. Thank
6 you and good afternoon. And I want to thank Joe for
7 that testimony. I think we need to hear more of
8 that in these - in these RGGI hearings. So again,
9 thank you for allowing me to testify today. I am
10 State Representative Jim Struzzi. I represent the
11 62nd legislative district in Indiana County.

12 I have two of the largest coal fired
13 electric generation plants in my district. And I am
14 proud to represent the hardworking families that
15 sustain our energy industry and power the east
16 coast. First, I want to state that I am opposed to
17 the overall process of these hearings during the
18 pandemic and during the holiday season when many are
19 distracted by other activities. These hearings and
20 this entire process should be placed on hold until
21 in-person public hearings can be held. Many of my
22 constituents are unable to participate due to lack
23 of internet access.

24 I am also opposed to the process of
25 enacting these rules without legislative approval.

1 If PA enters the regional greenhouse gas initiative,
2 we will be the only state that enters RGGI without
3 legislative approval, essentially without the voice
4 of all the Pennsylvania residents being heard. This
5 is unacceptable in a state that is constitutionally
6 governed by legislative representatives.

7 To that end I introduced House Bill
8 2025 that one of the previous speakers mentioned
9 earlier this year that would have required
10 legislative approval for RGGI or any multi-state
11 compact. The bill, which Governor Wolf vetoed,
12 received bipartisan support from representatives in
13 63 of 67 counties in Pennsylvania. The Governor's
14 RGGI plan was not presented as a piece of
15 legislation. It was presented as an executive
16 order, effectively circumventing the entire
17 legislative process.

18 This should not be moving forward
19 without a vote in the General Assembly. I am
20 hearing a lot of misinformation during these
21 hearings. Pennsylvania's membership in RGGI would
22 have far reaching repercussions that would impact
23 much more than our greenhouse gas emission levels,
24 which by the way have already been reduced
25 significantly more than the Governor's climate

1 action rules, the required reductions under the now
2 repealed clean power plant and the Paris Climate
3 Accord.

4 We have already achieved reductions
5 comparable to those of RGGI member states, all
6 without a carbon tax or a cap and trade system.
7 This decision would have a direct negative impact
8 not only on the employees of these energy producers,
9 but for all Pennsylvania residents who consume
10 energy. RGGI states have seen significant increases
11 in consumer electric rates. But again, none of
12 these negative impacts are being discussed by the
13 administration or in the DEP modeling.

14 And when these negative impacts were
15 mentioned during Zoom hearings this spring, three
16 DEP advisory committees voted against moving RGGI
17 forward. And Joe mentioned that as well. I think
18 that speaks volumes, and yet RGGI is still
19 advancing. If RGGI is enacted, we will lose
20 thousands of well paying energy related jobs. The
21 promise of possible future jobs is not going to help
22 the families and communities I represent.

23 We already know our power plants will
24 close if RGGI is implemented and our jobs and
25 capital investment will go to Ohio and West

1 Virginia. Our four coal fired electric generation
2 plants in western Pennsylvania account for 8,170 and
3 contribute \$2.87 billion dollars to our economy
4 annually. In Indiana County alone that is 1,490 and
5 \$873,000,000 million to our local economy.

6 Thousands of other jobs in our
7 communities that rely on these industries will be
8 lost as well. The loss of these jobs will have a
9 devastating impact on our local school districts
10 that rely on property taxes from these plants for
11 these budgets. But don't take my word on the job
12 losses, seventeen (17) different trade unions from
13 all corners of the state that represent these
14 hardworking Pennsylvanian families supported my bill
15 and opposed RGGI.

16 I believe that these measures proposed
17 by the Governor would impact all Pennsylvanians in
18 ways not considered by the Governor or DEP. This is
19 not about climate change. It is about creating a
20 tax on this specific industry. If RGGI is
21 implemented, then PA will go from being an energy
22 exporter to an energy importer. Our economy will
23 suffer and we will see more jobs, families and
24 industry leave our state.

25 RGGI will put our energy industry out

1 of business and the carbon tax money the
2 administration is counting on will be gone as well.

3 Pennsylvanian workers have been beaten down too
4 much this year already and it is time for that to
5 stop. There are other ways to address climate
6 change without hurting the industry and jobs. I
7 implore you to consider the economic and other
8 impacts of RGGI.

9 No one from the administration has
10 come to Indiana County. No one has stood before my
11 communities, these men and women and their families
12 and looked them in the eye to tell them they are
13 killing their jobs and industry now for a benefit
14 that might, might occur in a few decades. If you
15 had these hearings in the communities most affected
16 like Indiana County, I can guarantee the testimony
17 would be dramatically different than what I heard
18 today. The people I represent will be crushed by
19 RGGI and I implore you to consider that. Thank you.

20 CHAIR: Thank you, Representative
21 Struzzi. Next, we have number 60, Gary Kline.

22 MR. KLINE: Hello. I am Gary Kline.
23 I am representing Homer City Generating Station.
24 Homer City Generating Station is an independent
25 electrical generating station located in Indiana

1 County. Homer City has three generating units to
2 generate 1,880 megawatts of electrical power, which
3 is supplied through the PJM electrical system.
4 Homer City currently has 168 full-time employees and
5 typically utilizes about 50 contractors during
6 operation.

7 In addition, the station supply chain
8 supports numerous other businesses in the local
9 community. Homer City currently pays \$100,000,000
10 dollars annually for payroll, contractors and
11 vendors excluding fuel costs. Homer City also
12 annually pays \$1.7 million dollars in state taxes
13 and \$1.4 million dollars in local taxes. If the
14 Commonwealth joins RGGI, Homer City would be forced
15 to shut down and these business and tax revenues
16 would be permanently lost in Indiana County and the
17 Commonwealth.

18 RGGI regulations will also cause
19 stranded investments for air pollution and emission
20 controls installed in Homer City. Since 2012 Homer
21 City Station has invested more than \$812,000,000 to
22 comply with new state and federal air quality
23 regulation. As a result of these investments, Homer
24 City Station has reduced SO2 emissions by 95
25 percent, NOX emissions by 75 percent and particulate

1 emissions by 60 percent.

2 The upgraded emission controls were
3 necessary for Homer City Station to continue to
4 produce electricity and to continue providing jobs
5 to its employees, contractors and suppliers. Unlike
6 utility owned generating stations, which can recover
7 their operating costs from their rate payers, Homer
8 City must recover its costs, including the cost of
9 pollution control improvement projects, from the
10 price of the electricity itself.

11 Homer City Station made the investment
12 in these upgraded controls with the reasonable
13 expectation that compliance with the new regulations
14 would allow us to continue generating electricity at
15 competitive prices and to continue to be a positive
16 contributor to the local and state economy.

17 At the time, these investment decision
18 were made there was no indication that the
19 Commonwealth was considering joining RGGI. If the
20 Commonwealth joins RGGI, Homer City Station will be
21 forced to purchase CO2 allowances. With this
22 additional operating cost, Homer City will not be
23 able to generate electricity at a cost competitive
24 with other generators who are not in a RGGI state,
25 such as Ohio and West Virginia.

1 RGGI will impose substantial
2 regulatory and economic burdens on Homer City, which
3 will jeopardize its ability to operate. Leaving
4 almost a billion dollars of new investment stranded,
5 interfere with Homer City's investment back
6 expectation and cause an economic disaster for its
7 employees, contractors, suppliers and neighbors.

8 RGGI regulation will cause generation
9 to shift to nearby non-RGGI area and corresponding
10 emission increases will impact Pennsylvania without
11 the corresponding economic benefit. The New England
12 states and New York that have adopted RGGI
13 regulations have replaced in-state power generation
14 and jobs with imported power from Canada. When
15 Delaware and Maryland enacted RGGI regulations their
16 in-state regulation was replaced with imported power
17 largely from Pennsylvania, West Virginia and
18 Virginia.

19 Pennsylvania is not able to import
20 Canadian power. The replacement power for lost
21 generation in Pennsylvania will be provided by power
22 plants located in Ohio, West Virginia and other
23 states where RGGI rules do not apply. This will
24 result in no net reduction in CO2 emissions for the
25 region, just lost jobs, lost state and local tax

1 revenues for the townships and counties where the
2 shut down power plants are located.

3 Increased generation from non-RGGI
4 states will also result in more cross state CO2 NOX
5 and SO2 emissions entering Pennsylvania. These
6 additional out of state emissions will offset any
7 emission reductions in Pennsylvania caused by the
8 RGGI tax on Pennsylvania generation. Thank you.

9 CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, Gary.

10 Next up --- or last we have number 61,
11 Gregory Rightstone. Gregory, are you there? I am
12 hearing a buzzing. But I can't hear you.

13 MR. RIGHTSTONE: Better?

14 CHAIR: Yes, that's better.

15 MR. RIGHTSTONE: All right. Good
16 afternoon. I am Gregory Rightstone of Allison Park,
17 Pennsylvania. And I am a lifelong resident of
18 Pennsylvania, a geologist, author and incoming
19 executive director of the CO2 Coalition of Arlington
20 Virginia. The CO2 Coalition's leadership and its
21 60 members are a who's who of vehement scientists
22 studying carbon dioxide and climate change,
23 including atmospheric physicists, climatologists,
24 ecologists, statisticians and energy experts.

25 In carrying out our mission we seek to

1 strengthen the understanding of the role of science
2 and the scientific process in addressing complex
3 public policy issues like climate change.
4 Approaches to policy that do not adhere to the
5 scientific process risk great damage to the economy
6 and science. Such is the case with the proposal to
7 enroll the state into the economically crippling
8 carbon dioxide scheme known as the regional
9 greenhouse gas initiative.

10 Its primary goal is to make
11 electricity generated with natural gas and coal more
12 expensive through a cap and trade system. I will
13 not address the obvious negative impacts the plan
14 would have on our citizens, our companies and the
15 expected damage to our environment from industrial
16 scale wind and solar projects. But I will take a
17 look now at the incorrect justifications presented
18 as to why this is needed.

19 PA DEP secretary Paul McDonald stated
20 the impacts of climate change have had and will
21 continue to have a dramatic effect on Pennsylvania.

22 And Governor Wolf justifies it by falsely claiming
23 a litany of negative effects of supposed manmade
24 warming, including increases in precipitation and
25 flooding, heat related illness and death, and

1 worsening air pollution.

2 None of these, absolutely none, are
3 supported by the science and the facts. These are
4 simply fabricated assertions intended to gen up
5 public fear and alarm over impending climate
6 catastrophe. What the two either don't know or
7 ignore, is the fact that the modest warming of more
8 than one degree since 1900 combined with increase in
9 carbon dioxide had led to an earth and humanity that
10 is thriving and prospering and will continue to do
11 so.

12 The facts and the data reveal that by
13 every metric the earth's ecosystems are thriving and
14 humanity is prospering. The Governor points mainly
15 at precipitation and flooding an effect of increase
16 CO2 and global warming. Here he is conflating
17 climate with weather, which is a common practice in
18 the popular media. It is true that 2018 and 2019
19 had above average precipitation but so far in 2020
20 is substantially below the average, further
21 contradicting the claims of increased precipitation
22 and flooding are NOAA's records showing the highest
23 increase, increased precipitation in the 1940s and
24 50s and it's been declining since.

25 You can bet if recent rainfall records

1 were below normal, the Governor would be claiming
2 that the drought was due to global warming. As
3 proposals to rely on more and more on wind donor,
4 the Governor should consult the Pennsylvania Game
5 Commission, permanently banned all wind projects on
6 the one and a half million acres of the land it
7 controls. The Game Commission voted unanimously for
8 a lifetime ban on wind projects and, quote, a high
9 probability of adversely impacting wildlife
10 resources and the recreational uses associated with
11 the state game lands. The Pennsylvania Game
12 Commission found proposals for new wind facilities
13 incompatible with its mandates under the code to
14 protect, propagate, manage and preserve the game and
15 wildlife of the Commonwealth for both recreational
16 opportunities.

17 RGGI would damage the Pennsylvania
18 economy with higher energy prices and job losses for
19 no reason other than to boost tax revenues for a
20 spendthrift government and enrich the politically
21 favored in the so called green energy business of
22 big wind and big solar. Governor Wolf's promotion
23 of fear with false claims to advance the program is
24 demagoguery at the worst.

25 Simply put, RGGI is a solution in

1 search of a problem. Thank you.

2 CHAIR: All right. Thank you.

3 And thank you all for your patience
4 today in taking the time to provide your testimony.

5 One more reminder, if you haven't already done so,
6 please email your written comments to reg comments
7 at PA.gov, so we can ensure that we got your
8 comments accurately. And with no other commenter's
9 present on behalf of the EQB, I hereby adjourn this
10 hearing at 4:48 p.m. Thank you all.

11 * * * * *

12 HEARING CONCLUDED AT 4:48 P.M.

13 * * * * *

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing proceeding was reported by me on 12/10/2020 and that I, Bernadette M. Black, read this transcript, and that I attest that this transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceeding. This notarial act involved the use of communication technology.

Dated the 18th day of January, 2021

Bernadette M. Black

Bernadette M. Black,
Court Reporter